

Anglicanism and the Ephesians 4 Gifts

Towards a Leadership Model that Disciples and Equips the Church for Mission

Kaye Dyer

A research project, MINS590, submitted in partial fulfilment
of the requirements of the degree of Master of Ministry

Department of Theology and Religious Studies
University of Otago, New Zealand
Supervisor: Rev Dr Kevin Ward
November 2017

Abstract

This research project has two aims; to look for evidence that Hirsch's proposition that the five ministry gifts of Eph 4:11, the apostle, prophet, evangelist, pastor and teacher are needed to transition an institutional church to a missional church culture and to discover where the current leadership are on the journey of understanding, training and releasing these gifts. A mixed method approach was used. Thirteen ministry leaders, a combination of church leaders, diocesan ministry team and parachurch leaders were interviewed and historical documents were accessed.

The context of the research is the call in 2010 for the traditional Anglican churches in the Diocese of Nelson to transition from an institutional culture to a missional culture. With an increasing number of people in the community having no contact with a faith community, church growth principles no longer yielded the results they once did. A changing cultural context required a new approach.

It was found that attempts to revitalize the church without the generative gifts of apostle and prophet had limited success. The current research supports the hypothesis that the Eph 4 ministry gifts have meaningful and practical implications for shifting churches to a missional model. The pastor and teacher leadership model which served Christendom in the past is no longer sufficient to provide the kind of leadership required today. The more generative ministries of apostolic, prophetic and evangelistic people are needed to bring an outward focus, balance and renewed energy.

Overall the analysis suggested two key factors that would facilitate positive change. Firstly, that 3DM discipleship training is prioritised, especially with youth and younger adults, for mission and leadership will follow. Secondly, Nelson Diocese would benefit by being strategic in uncovering, encouraging and providing specialist training for the three overlooked ministries of apostle, prophet and evangelist, giving them equal honour and voice to what is currently enjoyed by teachers and pastors.

Acknowledgements

I would like to express my thanks to friends, family and colleagues who have accompanied me on this journey. Your encouragement and listening ears have been much appreciated. Special thanks go to all those who participated and willingly gave their time to be interviewed. To those who insisted this paper was finished when my enthusiasm was waning, thank you. To those who encouraged me by asking for a copy to read before anything was on paper, thank you.

Special thanks to my supervisor, Dr Kevin Ward, for his valuable advice and guidance.

Contents

	Abstract	iii
	Acknowledgements	iv
	Glossary	vii
Chapter 1	Introduction and Background	1
Chapter 2	Literature Review	14
Chapter 3	Biblical Framework	31
Chapter 4	Research Design and Methods	47
Chapter 5	Summary of Findings	52
Chapter 6	Analysis and Discussion	69
Chapter 7	Conclusion	86
	Bibliography	93
Appendix A	APEST Summary - Hirsch and Catchim	95
Appendix B	APEST Summary – Absalom	97
Appendix C	Interview Questions	99

Glossary

3DM - 3 Dimensional Movements is a global movement with the aim of putting mission and leadership back into the hands of ordinary people.

APEPT - an acronym for apostle, prophet, evangelist, pastor, teacher.

APEST - an acronym for apostle, prophet, evangelist, shepherd, teacher.

APes - an acronym for the three pioneering gifts: apostles, prophets, evangelists.

CANZ - Church Army in New Zealand is a lay order of evangelists in the Anglican Church.

Christendom - This is the expression of church and mission that has been known from AD312 to the present. It is marked by a focused on a building as the gathering place at its centre and a professionalised clergy who are primarily shepherd teachers.

Fivefold ministry - refers to the five gifts given to the church by Jesus Christ, apostles, prophets, evangelists, shepherds (pastors) and teachers as listed in Ephesians 4:11.

Institutional Church - The organisation set up for the purpose of giving structural support to the church. Over time this has evolved into a centralised power base and passivity in the majority of members.

Missional Church - A church that defines itself, and organises its life around its purpose as an agent of God's mission to the world.

MOSP - Mission Order of St Paul.

T4T - Training for Trainers is an evangelism and discipling method used in rapidly multiplying church planting movements. From day one disciples are taught to disciple others.

YWAM - Youth with a Mission.

Chapter 1

Introduction

The gifts he gave were that some would be apostles, some prophets, some evangelists, some pastors and teachers, to equip the saints for the work of ministry, for building up the body of Christ, until all of us come to the unity of the faith and of the knowledge of the Son of God, to maturity, to the measure of the full stature of Christ.

(Eph 4:11-13, NRSV)

Thesis Proposal

“Ephesians 4: 11-13 presents implications for transitioning traditional Anglican churches from an institutional culture to a missional culture. It is proposed that identifying and understanding these implications will open the way for the church to move forward towards becoming more missional”

Amid declining church attendance and aging congregations the Anglican Church in the Diocese of Nelson has recognised that a change in paradigm¹ is needed if the church is to communicate the gospel to the wider community and especially to the younger generations. The cultural context has changed greatly since the 1960s when churches and Sunday Schools were full, yet for the most part the church continues to function as it has done in the past, spending most of her resources maintaining a system that ministers to the needs of the congregations.

Alan Hirsh, a missiologist, who has led a church through the transition from institutional to missional, believes the answer lies in a broader leadership profile than what we have historically assumed. He comments:

It is time for the church to recognize the importance of welcoming leaders with all five of the Ephesians 4 functions into the church. Every significant missional movement has in some way incorporated the five functions into its system. When apostles, prophets, evangelists, shepherds, and teachers are working together, a wonderful missional ecology is created. Not only is this a more biblically faithful model, it also provides a theologically rich, organically consistent, and organizationally comprehensive

¹ A way of looking at things or a belief system that determines how we do things.

framework to help the church become more missionally effective and culturally agile.²

If Hirsch is correct, it would be prudent to seriously consider his words and listen to his wisdom as a traveller who is ahead of the Anglican Church on this journey. This research seeks to answer some questions that will help identify where the Anglican churches in the Nelson diocese are on this journey and what might be a way ahead that will assist these churches make the transition to a missional culture. What might this model look like in an Anglican structure? Changing the church structure is outside the scope of this study. The intention is to work within the current structure and identify some possible ways of moving forward. However this paper will engage with some current conversations about changes that might be beneficial to the mission of God.

Research Questions

This study is based around six broad questions:

1. How do church leaders understand the APEST gifts and how do they relate to the ordained leadership of the Anglican Church?
2. To what extent is the church identifying, training and releasing all five APEST³ gifts?
3. What are the obstacles to seeing all five APEST gifts released in the Anglican Church?
4. Is our current leadership model with an emphasis on teaching and pastoral ministry sufficient for the changes the diocese wants to make or is the new skill set required more naturally resident in those with apostolic, prophetic and evangelistic gifting?
5. Noting the intention of the diocese to move towards team leadership, how will acknowledging and releasing the ministries of the apostle, prophet, evangelist, shepherd and teacher, better lead our diocese and equip all believers to exercise their God given callings in their homes, workplaces and communities?
6. What could an APEST ministry look like within the Anglican framework?

² Alan Hirsh, "Three Overlooked Leadership Roles," *Christianity Today*, Spring, 2008. Cited online 15 Nov 2017. www.christianitytoday.com/pastors/2008/spring/7.32.html

³ APEST is an abbreviation for apostle, prophet, evangelist, shepherd and teacher.

This chapter gives some background to the research. Firstly a reflection on the exciting growth in the 1990s followed by a gradual decline and secondly, an overview of the rationale behind the formation of the Institute of New Anglicanism. Also included is a brief summary of the structure of the Anglican Church in New Zealand, the roles of clergy, the makeup of the Marlborough regional deanery where the research is based and a short description of the roles of three specialist training/ministry providers.

Background

1.1 The 1990s Growth Period

In the 1990s Derek Eaton, the new bishop of Nelson with a vision for growth, appointed Bob Barrett, an experienced vicar, gifted as a leader and a strategist as parish consultant to work alongside the parish clergy with the aim of turning the diocese around. By 1996 the diocese was being hailed overseas as one of the fastest growing dioceses in the western world.⁴ Over six years church attendance increased by 36.4%.⁵ There are no records to show how many of the new attendees were transferring from another church in the area and how many were people returning to church.

The growth followed a deliberate strategy. First the morale of the diocese was lifted by gathering the people together for several inspirational diocesan conferences. Resources and energy were spent identifying and removing obstacles to parish growth. Church plants were assessed to ensure there was a warm, welcoming environment for all ages. Solutions were found where there was insufficient seating capacity or car parking space. Notice boards and bathroom facilities were upgraded. Clergy were provided with opportunities to improve ministry skill and received training to help grow their leadership capacity, understand the growth barriers and leadership style needed for different sized churches. Financial resources were redirected to put extra staff into parishes to help clergy through the initial change period. Clergy were encouraged to be present in their parishes rather than on committees. Encouragement and assistance was given to plant new congregations with alternative worship and music styles. Crèches were built and encouragement was given to children's ministries.

Training for laity was provided in each region to make it accessible to as many people as possible. Churches worked at creating a welcoming culture for visitors. Ministry skills taught included training for worship leaders, preachers, prayer leaders and small group leaders.

⁴ Richard Kew and Roger White, *Towards 2015: A Church Odyssey* (Cambridge, Mass, 1997), 105.

⁵ Bishop's address to synod, *Year Book and Summary of Proceedings of the Synod of the Diocese of Nelson 1996*, Anglican Centre Archives, 150.

In 1997 attendances began to plateau, and then fall off slowly over the following years.⁶ In 2000 the parish consultant moved to another position in Auckland and that experience and guidance was no longer available. The parish consultant position changed focus to become the bishop's chaplain for church development. After working very hard for nine years many clergy reported burnout. The parish growth was not providing sufficient funding to maintain the extra staffing.

There are many reasons that could have contributed to the decline. Each parish had its own context which contributed to the growth and decline in numbers. Attendance figures do not show the full picture. Local knowledge is needed. Suggestions as to why the growth was not sustained include:

- Clergy did not (or could not) make the required change in ministry/leadership style as numbers grew;⁷
- Appointments did not always match the position;
- Staff reduction which was needed because growth did not bring sufficient finance to maintain the increased staffing level;
- Many clergy reported burnout;
- Clergy leaving (for health or other opportunities) before growth was sufficiently consolidated;
- Restructuring of the diocese in 1997 resulted in increased centralisation and less buy-in from parishes;
- Conflict in some parishes absorbed energy- including staff team conflict;
- Support offered to parishes after 2000 was less strategic.
- Depopulation in rural areas due to people leaving to follow employment opportunities;
- Public conflict over the sale of the historic Bishopdale estate (1997-2003).⁸

Some parishes showed strong growth. Positives seen in churches that grew include:

- Strategic ability in the vicar or the leadership team;
- Strong musical skill and/or strong preaching skill;

⁶ A 16% decline was reported from the peak in 1996 to 2006. Statistics Commission Report, *Year Book and Summary of Proceedings of the Synod of the Diocese of Nelson 2007*, Anglican Centre Archives, 57.

⁷ In conversation with Bob Barrett, 16 August 2017.

⁸ Robin Kingston, "The Derek Eaton Years 1990-2006" in *Harvest of Grace* (Nelson: Anglican Diocese of Nelson, 2010), 326.

- Sufficient financial resources within the parish to retain needed staff;
- A predecessor with a history of preparing a parish for growth.

By 2010 many of the new congregations planted in the 1990s were struggling. The learning from this period did seem to make it clear that clergy need not only a theological education; they also need to be taught practical ministry and leadership skills.

The parish consultant identified his belief that in order to be an evangelistic church, six principles needed to be in play. These included worship, incorporation, small groups for pastoral care, discipleship, every member ministry and leadership, which all need to be covered in prayer, with relationships being the glue.⁹

Although APEST giftings were not spoken of at this time it is clear that when a diversity of gifts was present in the leadership team and the team was working harmoniously together there was a strong platform for growth. E.g. Bishop Derek has a strong teacher gifting, is an encourager and carried the vision for growth suggesting a teacher evangelist gift. He understood the role of a bishop to be “a missionary, teacher, and evangelist, not an administrator.”¹⁰ The Parish Consultant had strong analytical and leadership skills that suggest an apostle teacher gift. This made a strong team with complementary strengths. This was also evidenced in parishes that showed considerable growth. Examples are:¹¹

- A shepherd evangelist (or evangelist shepherd) teamed with a teacher.
- An apostolic and prophetic couple assisted by an apostolic evangelist.
- A teacher evangelist (although this church declined again at the 200 barrier.)
- An apostolic evangelist assisted by a team.

The decade 1990-2000 was termed the Decade of Evangelism. In hindsight from 1990-1996 were the easy years of growth. Much of the growth appeared to be transfer growth or people who had grown up within the church environment returning to church. The church growth figures and baptism figures are vastly different. Diocesan statistics for

⁹ In conversation with Bob Barrett, 16 August 2017.

¹⁰ Richard Kew and Roger White, *Towards 2015*, 105.

¹¹ These gifts are the author's perception of the leadership.

child baptisms and blessings peaked in the middle to late 1990s and adult baptisms (aged 13+) showed a slight increase over this period with one church having a large group in one year. In the author's church it was not local residents who formed the basis of a new congregation, but several families from England who arrived in the same year. Alpha was the primary method of evangelism. The pattern was parishioners invited friends to an Alpha course where the faith would be presented by clergy rather than people being taught to present the gospel themselves. In the 1990s the new younger clergy who came into the diocese were baby boomers and they were given permission to experiment with adding a non-liturgical or an informal form of worship that related to their peers. By the mid 1990s the baby boomers were in the 30-50 year age bracket. The pool of people from which the growth came was beginning to dry up.

The next challenge came with the children of the baby boomers. The author's experience was those who had an encounter with God and a place to belong, such as a music group, which brought the young people close to the lives of adults with a living faith, was a very powerful combination. However it was noted that the young people who grew up within the church culture had difficulty creating or imagining an alternative worship style more suited to their generation. Their experience of the attractional model of church born out of Christendom was deeply ingrained.

Kevin Ward makes the point that many evangelical leaders embraced church growth but “never really looked hard enough at either how the growth of those particular institutions fits in to the broader patterns of religious and cultural change in society, or at where the people coming into these churches have come from.”¹²

Today we are another generation away from Christendom with two or three generations now having no connection with the biblical story. With aging congregations the church finds itself in a missional context that requires a rethink of our models of ministry. The parish system with a full-time resident priest functioned well in Christendom but is now under increasing strain. It is time to explore other models of ministry. In particular what can we learn from those who lived in the missional context before Christendom?

¹² Kevin Ward, “Christendom, Clericalism, Church and Context”, < www.presbyterian.org.nz/about-us/research-resources/research-papers/christendom-clericalism-church-and-context (31 August 2017).

1.2 The Institute for New Anglicanism

In 2010, a new initiative, the Institute for New Anglicanism was launched as a partnership between Bishopdale Theological College and the Diocese of Nelson. There was a desire to transition the diocese to be more missional. Tim Harris, who was the dean of Bishopdale Theological College, explained the rationale behind this.

“In brief, *New Anglicanism* is an intentionally ‘missional’ mode of conceiving Anglican ministry for a new age and era, drawing on but re-contextualising distinctive Anglican ‘DNA’ that characterised and shaped the original Anglican innovations.

New Anglicanism is grounded in four core principles:

1. It is ‘evangelical’ in conviction (in the gospel affirming sense of the word).
2. It is a mindset that has a missional priority (understood within the overarching biblical mission of God).
3. It recognises the reality of profound paradigm shifts in our present ministry context (post-Christendom, post-colonial, post-modern, hyper-connected global age).
4. It is Anglican in ecclesiology in identifying with the ‘Church catholic’ and the radical spirit of ‘considered innovation’ that characterised the early formation of Anglicanism.”¹³

He continued to explain that changes would be needed:

“This calls for a related paradigm shift in our thinking in what we conceive of as Anglican ministry. The shifts in missional context and associated modes of church and ministry call for a significant change in mindset by all those engaged in or embarking upon ministry in an Anglican context. New skills are called for and leadership training needs to address the paradigm shifts we now move within. A clearly ‘missional’ mindset drawing on a wider range of skill-sets is vital for the future of ministry in an Anglican context.”¹⁴

“In particular the expectation is that ministry leadership will change from being clergy dominated to a team ministry which will also include lay ministers.”¹⁵

In 2013 stipendiary diocesan clergy undertook training, one day per month, based on Chris Wright’s book *The Mission of God*, with speakers providing input in their specialist areas. Diocesan training events with specially chosen speakers were another source of inspiration and encouragement.

Bringing the deep cultural change necessary to a mature system such as the Anglican Church is a very challenging task. It is relatively easy to know where we want the

¹³ Tim Harris, *New Anglicanism-Introduction* <www.bishopdale.ac.nz/documents/VisionforINA-latest_003.pdf page 1> (4 April 2014).

¹⁴ *Ibid.*, 4.

¹⁵ *Ibid.*, 3.

church to be but it is much more difficult to effect the systemic changes needed, particularly when aging congregations and diminishing resources are realities.

To be faithful to the mission of God that we are called to participate in, we must acknowledge that fact that we have been caught up in a changing culture and need to do things differently. The purpose of this research project is to test whether Hirsch's statement is correct and to suggest what this model could look like in an Anglican structure. Changing the church structure is outside the scope of this study. The intention is to identify some possible ways of moving forward within the current system; however this paper does engage with some current conversations about changes that might be beneficial to the mission of God.

1.3 Structures and Ministry of the Anglican Church in Aotearoa New Zealand and Polynesia

Since 1992 the constitution of the Anglican Church in Aotearoa New Zealand and Polynesia has worked in a three tikanga structure to enable each partner to operate in a way that suited their own cultural context. Tikanga Pakeha consists of seven dioceses, one of which is the Nelson diocese. Tikanga Maori is divided into five hui amorangi and Tikanga Pasefika, also known as the diocese of Polynesia, includes Fiji, Samoa, Tonga and the Cook Islands. Each diocese or hui amorangi is led by a bishop and each tikanga elects an archbishop. Each diocese is governed by its own synod which functions in three houses: bishops, clergy and laity. In New Zealand the Anglican Church is linked together by a common constitution and governed by General Synod. Services that have been authorised for use in churches can be found in *A New Zealand Prayer Book*.

The Nelson Diocese covers the top of the South Island, down to Kaikoura on the east coast and Greymouth in the west. The diocese is divided in four regional deaneries, Nelson, Tasman, Marlborough and Mawhera. This research has been conducted in the Marlborough regional deanery which consists of eight parish units of varying sizes.

1.4 Anglican Ordained Ministry (Clergy)

The Anglican Church recognises three orders of ordained ministry: bishops, priests and deacons. The ordination services in *A New Zealand Prayer Book* give a description of the role shared by ordained ministers:¹⁶

After his resurrection and ascension
Christ gave gifts abundantly to the Church.
Some he made apostles, some prophets, some evangelists,
some pastors and teachers; to equip God's people
for their work of ministry and to build up the body of Christ.

We stand within a tradition
in which there are deacons, priests and bishops.
They are called and empowered to fulfil an ordained ministry
and to enable the whole mission of the Church.

Each order also has its own particular roles laid down:

Deacons in the Church of God serve in the name of Christ,
and so remind the whole Church
that serving others is essential to all ministry.
They have a special responsibility to ensure that those in need
are cared for with Christlike compassion and humility.
When called upon to do so, they may baptise,
preach and give instruction in the faith.
When the people are gathered for worship,
deacons are authorised to read the Holy Scriptures,
lead the prayers,
and distribute the bread and wine of Holy Communion.¹⁷

The deacon's role is not well defined today as it has become common practice for lay people to fill pastoral roles, read scripture, lead prayers, distribute communion, teach and preach. There has been some discussion about the roles of deacons, especially around a permanent diaconate, which will be addressed in a later chapter.

The role of priest is defined thus:

Priests in the Church
are called to build up Christ's congregation,
to strengthen the baptised,
and to lead them
as witnesses to Christ in the world.
To do this they are called to be pastors.
They are to share people's joys and sorrows,

¹⁶ ANZPB, 890, 900, 912.

¹⁷ Ibid. 891.

encourage the faithful, recall those who fall away,
heal and help the sick.

Above all they are to proclaim God's word
and take their part in Christ's prophetic work,
to declare forgiveness through Jesus Christ,
to baptise, to preside at the Eucharist,
to administer Christ's holy sacraments.¹⁸

A priest does not necessarily have a church leadership position. A priest can serve in a variety of capacities. While the majority are likely to lead a parish (as vicar or priest-in-charge), other options include parish staff, theological college lecturer, hospital, prison, industrial or school chaplaincy, diocesan staff, a non-stipendiary priest, etc.

The role of the bishop is defined thus:

Bishops are sent to lead by their example
in the total ministry and mission of the Church.
They are to be Christ's shepherds
in seeking out and caring for those in need.
They are to heal and reconcile,
uphold justice and strive for peace.
Bishops are to exercise godly leadership
in that part of the Church committed to their care,
and to maintain wise discipline within its fellowship.
The Church looks to them to promote peace and unity
among all God's people,
and to encourage their obedience to God's word.
They are to keep the Church true to its faith,
as found in Scripture and the Creeds,
to teach this faith and proclaim it.
Bishops are to ensure that an episcopal ministry is maintained.
They are to ordain, send forth and care for the Church's pastors,
and to preside over its worshipping life.¹⁹

¹⁸ Ibid., 901.

¹⁹ Ibid., 913.

1.5 Additional Anglican Resources for Ministry and/or Training

For the purposes of this research there are three Anglican resources for ministry and/or training that are available to the diocese, Bishopdale Theological College, the Mission Order of St Paul and the Church Army in New Zealand. The research sample included one interviewee from each one.

1.5.1 Bishopdale Theological College

Bishopdale Theological College,²⁰ BTC, is situated in Nelson and an integral part of the diocese. The college began in 2008 with the task of providing Anglican evangelical theological education for the diocese and training future clergy for the diocese and beyond. The college offers Bachelor of Theology and Bachelor of Ministry degrees in partnership with Laidlaw College as well as providing ongoing professional development and ministry training for clergy and laity. The Dean of BTC and the Ministry Education Coordinator in partnership with the bishop play key roles in the provision of training for the diocese.

1.5.2 Mission Order of St Paul

The Mission Order of St Paul,²¹ MOSP, a new initiative in the Diocese of Nelson, was begun in 2014 as a vehicle for releasing people, lay and ordained, into local mission and church planting. It has the goal of identifying, training, discipling and releasing lay missional leaders although clergy can also join. The constitution states “the task of all members is to initiate and inspire new expressions of church, and to establish and resource missional communities.”²² It is hoped that these will be able to connect with people who do not feel comfortable in the present church environment. Because of the vision of MOSP it is hoped that pioneers, i.e. apostles, prophets and evangelists, will gather together for support, encouragement and through the order be given authority to exercise ministry in different contexts. The Marlborough leader (a presbyter) is an ordained priest on a church staff. MOSP members are self-supporting and are expected to belong to a local Anglican church. No training is required. Individual members seek the training they need for their ministry area. The Bishop of Nelson fills the role of Provincial and provides oversight of the order.

²⁰ <www.bishopdale.ac.nz> (7 May 2017).

²¹ <www.nelsonanglican.org.nz/mosp> (7 May 2017).

²² <www.nelsonanglican.org.nz/ministry-resources> (7 May 2017).

1.5.3 The Church Army in New Zealand

Church Army NZ is a community of pioneering evangelists within the Anglican Church. They are mostly lay men and women, although some are ordained priests, who have had specialist training in evangelism. Their vision is to serve the least, the last and the lost, by living out and explaining the love of Jesus for each and every person and provide training for others. Their current focus is on Church Planting Movements²³ and the establishment of mission hubs around the country. Through Church Army NZ a variety of training options in evangelism, including field placements, are made available to the wider church. In 2017 new apprenticeship style training is being released and made available to any church that is interested in evangelism. Church Army NZ is a national body that reports to General Synod, as well as all diocesan synods. Officers carry a national licence as an evangelist but also receive a ministry licence from their own diocesan bishop. The society is a resource of trained people who are available to help train and equip the whole church for mission when invited to do so. This is a resource that has not yet been fully utilised in the Nelson diocese.

1.5.4 Conclusion

These three bodies have complementary functions so could be harnessed to provide the diocese with theological education, practical equipping in faith sharing and support for people who feel called to a ministry to people outside of the church, people who do not fit easily into the local church setting.

²³www.ca-nz.org Cited 7 May 2017.

Chapter 2

Literature Review

Some current literature that is relevant to the questions being asked in this research is presented here in three parts. The first part surveys writing by authors working outside of the Anglican Church structure where much of the research is found. The second is a survey of several studies from within an Anglican context. The current research subject is still new in Anglican conversations resulting in a shortage of studies directly connecting the Ephesians 4 gifts and the transitioning of a church from an inherited model to a missional model. However, there are some papers that touch on one aspect of the topic such as transitioning from an inherited model to a missional model, team ministry as in the local shared ministry model in New Zealand, the APEST gifts as a whole and a study of the apostolic role in the church today. The authors of all papers in the second section were clergy, either in the Anglican Church in New Zealand or the Church of England in the UK. The third section gives examples of churches that have restructured to affirm and include input from each of the APEST ministries.

2.1 Literature from Non-Anglican Sources

Writing from outside of the Anglican Church structures are experienced practitioners such as Alan Hirsch and Tim Catchim, J R Woodward and Neil Cole.

2.1.1 Alan Hirsch: *The Forgotten Ways*.²⁴ (2006, rev. 2016)

Hirsch wrote his book after being challenged by the question, ‘how did the early church do it?’ ‘How did they grow from a small group of about twenty-five thousand to over twenty million in two hundred years?’ Without all the resources we have at our disposal today they achieved what the church today is failing to do. This book challenges our thinking about how we do church. Hirsch sets out to identify the elements that made, not only the early church, but also the celtic church under Patrick, the Methodists under John Wesley and the church in China so effective as mission movements.

In his research Hirsch identifies what he terms movement DNA, (or mDNA), which he believes must all be present to effect a movement that will grow exponentially.

²⁴ Alan Hirsch, *The Forgotten Ways* rev. ed. (Grand Rapids: Brazos, 2016).

Acknowledging that the Holy Spirit provides the environment in which the work is birthed, empowered and sustained Hirsch lists the six factors as:²⁵

1. Jesus is Lord: Christology must be the theological centre of the movement.
2. Disciple Making: Living out the Lordship of Christ means becoming like Jesus and teaching others to do the same. Disciple making is essential for any church.
3. Missional-Incarnational Impulse: The missional part being the outward movement into the world while the incarnational part is going deeper so that the gospel gets embedded into every cultural group.
4. Liminality and Communitas: This is defined as an outward facing community involved in a mission adventure beyond themselves and contrasts to the inward focus, comfort and safety-seeking of community.
5. APEST culture:²⁶ This is about the ministry of the church, the presence of apostolic, prophetic, evangelistic, pastoral and teaching ministries. An apostolic person plays a catalytic role in generating and sustaining a movement and releasing all the APEST ministries.
6. Organic systems: This is about the being organised as an interconnected network with low control but high accountability, in contrast to a hierarchical system.

Of particular interest to this project is chapter eight in which Hirsch explains APEST culture. He holds the view that the APEST ministries are given to every disciple and not only leaders. Understanding leadership to be a calling within a calling Hirsch became “increasingly convinced of the need to thoroughly reframe inherited understandings of ministry and leadership” adding “I am absolutely convinced there has never been a genuine missional movement- the kind that has exponential growth as well as transformational impact cross a wide domain- that does not have APEST ministry.”²⁷ Hirsch concludes this chapter by giving examples of churches that have changed to an APEST structure. Some of these examples are included in the third section of this literature review.

²⁵ Ibid., 12-13.

²⁶ Hirsch changes this term to APEST culture in the 2016 revised edition.

²⁷ Hirsch, *The Forgotten Ways*, 189.

2.1.2 Alan Hirsch and Tim Catchim: *The Permanent Revolution: Apostolic Imagination and Practice for the 21st Century Church*,²⁸ (2012)

Alan Hirsch and Tim Catchim argue that the church lost its first century missional thrust because it exiled the apostles, prophets and evangelists from its leadership, relying instead on only the shepherds and teachers. This book takes the reader on a journey beginning with setting a framework for ministry based on Ephesians 4:1-16. Much of this section was contributed by Mike Breen. Further sections focus in turn on apostolic ministry, apostolic leadership and apostolic organization.

The authors argue that shepherd and teacher forms of ministry are not wired to produce the missional movement so needed today. Their contribution as builders of community and scholars is valuable for bringing stability to the church when working in partnership with all five of the APEST gifts. However, without the other three gifts operating, the shepherd and teacher led system eventually achieves an equilibrium that slowly dies through lack of ability to change. Such a system unconsciously ejects the apostles, prophets and evangelists, who by their nature challenge the status quo and work to bring change. Hence the authors advocate for a new system, one in which each of the five APEST gifts has its rightful place but not within a hierarchical model that we have become used to.

In the second section the authors paint a picture of apostolic ministry by contrasting the ministries of the original twelve Apostles with the post-ascension apostles. Based on Paul's ministry the description of an apostle includes planter (1 Cor 3:6-8), architect (1 Cor 3:10), foundation layer (1 Cor 3:10-15), father (1 Cor 4:14-21) and ambassador (2 Cor 5:18-21).²⁹ Even more important than what apostolic people do is the author's insight into the environment or atmosphere created by apostolic ministry beginning with a concern for spreading and maintaining the gospel to creating the context where all the APEST gifts can emerge³⁰. This section also expands on the Pauline image of apostolic ministry as missionary and church planter, by contrasting it with Peter's ministry which was largely to the people of God, further explaining that "Petrine spirituality is rooted in

²⁸ Alan Hirsch, Tim Catchim and Mike Breen, *The Permanent Revolution: Apostolic Imagination and Practice for the 21st Century Church*. (San Francisco: Jossey-Bass), 2012.

²⁹ Ibid., 102-104.

³⁰ Ibid., 107.

a call to missional discipleship.”³¹ Paul is described as a “cross-cultural pioneer and founder” but Peter, an “intracultural, visionary architect.” The authors conclude that while Pauline apostles are best suited to pioneering work, Petrine apostles are natural synergists, wired to be catalysts in the reformation of existing institutional structures, leading to the revitalization of the church and its forward movement, a key for the current project. This section contains several other vital insights for this task: the apostolic task is foundational and takes time for the results to be seen. Tenacity and patience are needed and renewal in the church is often stimulated by an innovative mission movement outside of the church.

In their third section Hirsch and Catchim focus on apostolic leadership addressing the make up of a pioneer who has an ability to invent new ideas and strategies, a willingness to break with old ways, a tolerance for risk, a need to be different and the strength to stand alone. They suggest churches “identify and empower people who are not bonded to the status quo, have the intellectual freedom to explore new possibilities, are not risk adverse, and are able to recombine ideas in a creative and innovative way”³². The authors contend that refusal to legitimize apostolic ministry is undermining the church’s mission, since to be missional is to be apostolic.³³ They explain that if “the church is simply a place where believers are cared for... and taught the basics of faith ... then it will likely lack the energy needed to generate new ideas and forms and the courage required to implement them.”³⁴

Finally, the authors expound their understanding of apostolic organization which should align with the church’s missional purpose. They maintain that renewal has always been a grassroots movement that generally begins on the edge, far from the centre. By movement, they are describing a model that is: decentralized, self-contained, self-funded, relational, lay led, reproducing and transformational. They draw attention to four areas of capital that they believe need to be developed: individual, community, organisation and movement.³⁵ Rather than a focus on individual conversions, the end goal is community transformation. The authors encourage us to focus on planting

³¹ Ibid., 123.

³² Ibid., 166.

³³ Ibid., 172. “Missional” is derived from *missio*, the Latin equivalent to *apostello*, “send.”

³⁴ Ibid., 201.

³⁵ Ibid., 222-225.

movements and planting the gospel rather than planting churches. It is their belief that there is a need for two complementary but distinct forms: modalities, the local church; and sodalities, the church in mission form.

Hirsch and Catchim highlight the challenges involved for a denominational church that is serious about its missional calling. All four sections are particularly relevant to the current research as they bring a depth of understanding as to why the role of the apostle is so important in releasing an APEST culture. They identify areas where change is required, not only in training and empowering the next generation but also in retraining those brave enough to risk that journey.

2.1.3 J.R. Woodward: *Creating a Missional Culture*.³⁶ (2012)

J.R. Woodward is an experienced American church planter and missiologist and cofounder of Ecclesia Network, a relational network of missional churches. As the title suggests his book focuses on the importance and power of culture in the mission of God. Woodward argues that “more than a strategy, vision or plan, the unseen culture of a church powerfully shapes her ability to grow, mature and live missionally.”³⁷ To this end he sees it as the role of Spirit-filled leaders to create this culture in their congregations. Woodward presents a case for a shift from a hierarchical to a shared leadership paradigm, or what he calls a polycentric leadership style, in which the five equipping gifts, apostle, prophet, evangelist, shepherd and teacher interrelate.³⁸

Pointing to the triune God as a model for leadership. Woodward sees a community of leaders serving within a community of priests.

Jesus is identified as the perfect example of each of the five equipping gifts and therefore is our model. After describing each of the gifts the author goes into more detail and expounds on their different leadership styles.

Woodward finishes by providing practical advice from his experience of working in a polycentric leadership model. He explains how the five equippers working together create a missional culture that produces a thriving, liberating, welcoming, healing and learning environment for all who come within its orbit.

³⁶ J.R. Woodward, *Creating a Missional Culture: Equipping the Church for the Sake of the World*. (Downers Grove: IVP), 2012.

³⁷ Ibid., 19.

³⁸ Ibid., 60.

Woodward has the advantage of working with a new church where he could create the culture he wanted. Although this is a very different context to the hierarchical model of the Anglican Church there is much in his book that can be applied to the current research especially the importance of identifying the unseen culture of a congregation and how an alternative cultural environment can be created by the equipping gifts. The author has some valuable insights into working in a team. The positional authority of a vicar or parish leader does not need to prevent a polycentric team model being developed within a parish or even across parish boundaries.

2.1.4 Neil Cole: *Primal Fire*³⁹ (2014)

Neil Cole is also an experienced church planter and pastor with an apostolic gifting.⁴⁰ He is recognised as a key catalyst in the organic church movement and is a founder of Church Multiplication Associates (CMA)⁴¹. He writes from twenty years experience working in a team of five church planters, each with a different APEST gift, As well as providing insight and an overview of each gift the author challenges the hierarchical leadership structure, which he believes the church has borrowed from the world's systems, as having no place in the kingdom of God. The book contains a large section describing the way each gift is contagious, a helpful term that suggests the creation of an environment around each gift. Cole divides this section into two: the foundation layers, which he calls the Start and Go team that is made up of apostles and prophets and the builders, which he calls the Stay and Grow team that is made up of evangelists, shepherds and teachers. He suggests that our churches are losing many of the APEs that Jesus gives because they are not been accepted and understood in our church structures, an issue that is relevant to the current study.

Cole is described as a Pauline apostle, best suited to beginning new work in the marketplace rather than refounding existing structures where this research is directed.

³⁹ Neil Cole, *Primal Fire: Reigniting the Church with the Five Gifts of Jesus* (Carol Stream, IL: Tyndale Momentum, 2011).

⁴⁰ Ibid., xi.

⁴¹ Ibid., 295.

2.1.5 Alan Hirsch: *5Q. Reactivating the Original Intelligence and capacity of the Body of Christ* (2017)⁴²

In *5Q* Alan Hirsch digs deeper into the APEST giftings. He defines 5Q as the synergy of a holistic recombination of the APEST capacities referred to in Ephesians 4.⁴³

Section one covers some of the basic material from his earlier books however, in chapter three Hirsch widens the readers understanding by viewing the APEST gifts through the lens of the created order showing that they are not limited to the faith community but can be evidenced in the broader human culture and history to be redeemed and given back to the church.

Further on Hirsch reminds the reader that Jesus is the exemplary apostle, prophet, evangelist, shepherd and teacher so to grow to be like Jesus is to grow in each of the gift areas with the result that the head and body be in correct alignment.

Section two is more practical in nature as the ideas are applied to the local church, organization, and leadership. Hirsch believes a helpful way to think of the marks of the true church is through using the APEST framework with five distinctives: Missional impact (A), Covenant faithfulness (P), Gospel proclamation (E), Reconciled community (S), and Deep wisdom (T). Not only is Jesus at the centre and the perfect expression of each APEST gift but he expresses himself through his people by these gifts. Of note was the author's perception that denominations have an APEST typology, in particular he perceived the Anglican Church to be shepherd, teacher and lateral prophetic.⁴⁴ Consequently the apostolic, vertical prophetic and evangelistic giftings lacked the honour and encouragement needed for them to grow.

The APEST pipeline showing a five level discipleship pathway from a disciple to an equipper of others was helpful.⁴⁵ It is understood that discipleship needs to take place in three primary environments: the classroom, by apprenticeship and by immersion, to provide a broad base where lives are transformed to be more like Jesus through

⁴² Alan Hirsch, *5Q* (unspecified:100M, 2017)

⁴³ Ibid., xxi. Hirsch uses 5Q for fivefold intelligence in a similar way to the better known IQ (intelligence quotient) and EQ (emotional intelligence).

⁴⁴ Hirsch, *5Q*, 102-105. Lateral or horizontal prophetic is described as humanity's covenantal faithfulness to others and the world including social justice issues, care of creation and a call to holiness. Vertical prophetic guards humanity's relationship to God and includes encountering God, worship, prayer and obedience.

⁴⁵ Hirsch, *5Q*, 156-159.

obedience to what God is saying. The depth of understanding of the different environment created by each APEST gift is valuable especially in this research, as it highlights what the church is missing out on if all five are not functioning correctly.

2.1.6 Alan Hirsch: Three Overlooked Leadership Roles.⁴⁶

In this article Hirsch claims that the roles of apostle, prophet and evangelist are overlooked in favour of the roles of shepherd and teacher.

Further, he asserts that current thinking in leadership theory and practice confirms the five differing ministry styles commenting that most organizational systems recognise the importance of five leadership functions:

- The entrepreneur: Innovator and cultural architect who initiates a new product, or service, and develops the organization.
- The questioner: Provocateur who probes awareness and fosters questioning of current programming leading to organizational learning.
- The communicator: Recruiter to the organization who markets the idea or product and gains loyalty to a brand or cause.
- The humanizer: People-oriented motivator who fosters a healthy relational environment through the management of meaning.
- The philosopher: Systems-thinker who is able to clearly articulate the organizational ideology in a way as to advance corporate learning.

⁴⁶ Alan Hirsch, "Three Overlooked Leadership Roles," *Christianity Today*, Spring, 2008. Cited online 15 Nov 2017. www.christianitytoday.com/pastors/2008/spring/7.32.html

2.2 Anglican Based Studies and Resources

2.2.1 Transitioning Churches from an Inherited Model to a Missional Culture

To change the culture of a system as old as the Anglican Church is a difficult task that requires new skills and much support for church leaders who often stand alone between people who want to keep the familiar and the church hierarchy who expect change or vice versa. The following paper is based in Wellington diocese.

Susan Blaikie: Equipping Missional Leaders to Embed Missional Culture in the Anglican Diocese of Wellington (2013)

Susan Blaikie's MMin research project is set in the Anglican Diocese of Wellington which in 2010 began challenging church leaders to make the transition from maintenance to a missional culture. Her research focuses on the quality and effectiveness of the initial training and support offered to church leaders to equip them to understand and lead the necessary cultural change processes and the obstacles they encountered. She interviewed six parish clergy who, from their own initiative, were already on this journey in their parishes and three clergy in the diocesan team who had responsibilities for training and supporting parish leaders. Blaikie does not enter into any discussion on the diversity of the giftedness of the leaders she interviewed nor does she make any comparison between the giftedness of those clergy who were making progress in the journey of transition and those who were struggling to do so. Her work identifies some of the complex issues involved in leading an older church system, such as the Anglican Church through cultural change. Blaikie's paper recognises a lack of equipping for church leaders in the area of cultural change as well as systemic obstacles as likely factors that keep pulling the church back to maintenance mode. Her research concludes with suggestions for a way forward including a strategy to assist in managing the difficult and complex process of culture change which can be shared with other dioceses. Blaikie's paper gives a broader perspective to the current research in that her interviewees have also been challenged to lead churches from a maintenance culture to a missional one. Whereas her investigation views the transition through an equipping and resourcing lens this study is being viewed through a gifting lens.

2.2.2 Team Ministry: Local Shared Ministry (LSM)

Team ministry is an important value for a missional church culture. Local Shared Ministry is a model of team ministry that was introduced into some smaller parishes that could no longer fund a full time stipendiary vicar. The dioceses that adopted this model hoped that this team approach would lead to growth as the gifts of the congregation had opportunity to be identified, trained and used. While the Diocese of Nelson did not embrace a form of LSM, instead using part-time and/or self-supporting ministry, there is valuable learning from this model of team ministry.

Haworth: The Triumph of Maintenance over Mission? Or Local Mission at the Flaxroots? (2009) ⁴⁷

Geoffrey Haworth's report is focused within Tikanga Pakeha of the Anglican Church of Aotearoa, New Zealand and Polynesia. In it he examines how LSM has developed in the six dioceses that introduced a form of it, how it has changed and where its future may be. In light of profound changes that have occurred in the outworking of LSM since the late 1980s when it was first imported into New Zealand, this study also examined what was the current practice in these dioceses making note of what was working and what was not. "LSM was clearly intended to be a "model" for mission and an antidote to the maintenance thinking that saw declining parishes under the leadership of part-time clergy."⁴⁸ His report concludes that too little theological thinking combined with inadequate resourcing led to it often becoming another way for the church to manage its decline.⁴⁹

On a more positive note Haworth noted that LSM has been successful in some places where new ministries have been raised up and the worshipping community is engaging with the challenges of ministry and mission.⁵⁰ In some areas the lack of success was attributed to depopulation, but in other places to a lack of people able and willing to replace those leaving or taking a break from ministry positions.⁵¹ In other words the church has not managed to attract younger members into the church community. High

⁴⁷ Geoffrey M.R. Haworth. "The Triumph of Maintenance over Mission or Local Mission at the Flaxroots? Change and Development in Local Shared Ministry in Tikanga Pakeha in the Anglican Church of Aotearoa, New Zealand and Polynesia." Diocese of Christchurch, 2009.

⁴⁸ Ibid, 69.

⁴⁹ Ibid, 78.

⁵⁰ Ibid, 69.

⁵¹ Ibid, 74.

quality oversight that includes resourcing, training, envisioning were noted by Haworth as essentials needed to revitalize ministry and mission.⁵²

Under LSM people were given responsibility for an area such as pastoral care, community-facing ministry, teaching ministry, sacramental ministry etc. Haworth's study raises questions about what is required to build a sustainable team ministry without burning out the people in leadership.

2.2.3 The Anglican Orders of Bishop, Priest and Deacon

Haworth's report also raised an issue around LSM, the controversy that grew from the confusion and inconsistency of LSM priesthood compared to the description in the Ordinal, in *A New Zealand Prayer Book*⁵³ and hence the relationship between LSM and stipendiary priests. LSM priests were not required to have the same training as stipendiary priests and sacramental, teaching and pastoral ministries were divided between different people. His report also includes a section advocating for vocational deacons, or permanent deacons, whose ministry would be a bridge between church and community.

Croft: Ministry in Three Dimensions: Ordination and Leadership in the Local Church (2008)⁵⁴

Steven Croft, a bishop in the Church of England who has experience with the missional movement, recognised that traditional descriptions of the ministry of deacons, priests and bishops are no longer sufficient for church today. His argument is that, rather than three strictly defined orders, ordained ministry should be seen as covering three overlapping dimensions, diakonia, presbyteral and episcopal. Every ordained minister would be called to ministry in each of the three dimensions. For example, clergy are now required to envision and lead their church through cultural change, deal with the conflict involved in that journey as well as help discern and enable the laity in their ministry roles and build community. Instead of working individually, skills are needed to work collaboratively with other clergy and lay people. Croft also advocates for a vocational diaconate which he describes as a community facing ministry. The value of

⁵² Ibid., 70.

⁵³ *A New Zealand Prayer Book*, 901-907.

⁵⁴ Steven Croft, *Ministry in Three Dimensions; Ordination and Leadership in the Local Church* (London: Darton, Longman & Todd, 2008)

his work is that it contributes to a discussion about a more elastic understanding of the traditional roles of the three orders of ordained ministry.

2.2.4 Training for Pioneering Ministry

Haworth includes discussion on issues around training, education, formation for ministry and the relationship between laity and clergy in the LSM model. Identification and training of those particularly suited to pioneering ministry is currently being attempted in the UK.

Baker and Ross (ed): The Pioneer Gift: Explorations in Mission (2014)⁵⁵

This is a collection of writings by sixteen different practitioners and theologians in pioneer ministry. The first chapter, authored by Jonny Baker, titled “The Pioneer Gift” is relevant to the current research. He has a great appreciation for the pioneer gift, understands it to be a difficult gift to carry in the present culture yet it is needed if the church is to move out of its comfort zone and take up a missional calling. Although the author does not mention the APEST gifts he does note that not all pioneers are the same; they have quite different ways of operating and interestingly his descriptions fitted the different apostolic, prophetic and evangelistic characteristics. In the UK ordained pioneer ministry is growing, however they are still in the process of working out how best to train pioneers. Baker agrees that the formation of pioneer ministers requires a different system from the usual ordained ministry.

Wright: The Mission of God’s People. A Biblical Theology of the Church’s Mission. (2010)⁵⁶

In 2012 the Nelson Diocese provided monthly training days to encourage clergy and leaders to engage a missional church focus. Wright’s book, *The Mission of God’s People*, was required reading. The author set out to expand the reader’s understanding of mission to God restoring all of creation to himself. He begins by asking a foundational question: What is the mission of God’s people? In other words, what is the

⁵⁵ Jonny Baker, “The Pioneer Gift” in *The Pioneer Gift: Explorations in Mission*, (ed) Jonny Baker and Cathy Ross (London: Canterbury Press, 2014).

⁵⁶ Christopher J.H. Wright. *The Mission of God’s People*. (Grand Rapids: Zondervan, 2010)

purpose of the church, what are we here for? The church exists to take part in God's mission;⁵⁷ God's people are called to join God's work in the world.

Of interest to this study is the author's explanation of missional church which he contends is not a new idea nor did it begin at Pentecost but with Abraham's call in Gen 12:1-3.⁵⁸ "Go...and be a blessing...and all the nations will be blessed through you." What God started with one man, became a family and then a nation, Israel. Jesus' command in Matt 28: 18-20 was sending his disciples out in the power of the Spirit to pass on the blessing of Abraham. The church is that "community of people, chosen and called since Abraham to be a vehicle of God's blessing to the nations."⁵⁹ He concludes that "missional church" is a term used in reaction to the institutionalized church which has lost touch with its purpose.⁶⁰ In fact, if the church is not missional it is not church!⁶¹

However, the author does not engage with the equipping dimension of the five Eph 4 ministry gifts. He takes a traditional view that "God gave pastors and teachers to the church to equip the saints"⁶² adding the apostles in Eph 4:11 "may well be referring to the wider apostolic (missionary) role, especially in planting and nurturing churches in the first place."⁶³

Breen: The Apostle's Notebook (2002)⁶⁴

In this book the author, as an Anglican priest in England, explores what it means to be apostolic starting with the ministry of Jesus. He records his journey to the margins of his denomination, an uncomfortable place but a place of fruitfulness. It is the story of how God led the author to restructure what had grown to be a large attractional church to form missional communities.

⁵⁷ Wright, *The Mission of God's People*, 24.

⁵⁸ Ibid, 73.

⁵⁹ Ibid.

⁶⁰ Ibid.

⁶¹ Ibid.

⁶² Ibid., 272.

⁶³ Ibid., 216.

⁶⁴ Mike Breen, *An Apostle's Notebook*, (Eastbourne: Kingsway Communications, 2002).

Mike Breen: Building a Discipling Culture (2011)⁶⁵

Mike Breen: Multiplying Missional Leaders (2012)⁶⁶

These are the first two books in a series of four in which the author sets out a discipleship process he has used successfully that formed disciples who became missional leaders that resulted in missional communities as a vehicle for local mission. The first book includes the basic teaching on the fivefold ministries, represented by the pentagon shape while the second sets out a mentoring process that empowers and releases disciples and multiples leaders. These books are particularly relevant to this study as a group of leaders in Nelson Diocese is beginning to introduce this training.

2.2.5 APEST Ministry Gifts

While leading St Thomas' Anglican Church in Sheffield in the 1990s, Mike Breen, developed a discipleship tool which he called LifeShapes⁶⁷. One of these, the pentagon, was a visual reminder of the importance of the APEST model of ministry. Those who worked alongside Breen in church leadership, Alex Absalom⁶⁸ and Andrew Dowsett have many years of experience in introducing missional culture that includes an understanding that the APEST ministry gifts are for every disciple of Jesus. Breen also made a contribution to the exegetical section in *The Permanent Revolution*.

Dowsett: Jesus-given: living the life you were called to be (2012-2013)⁶⁹

Andrew C. Dowsett, an Anglican priest in the UK⁷⁰, has written a six part paper in which he provides some background to APEST ministry and a summary of twenty gift combinations, for example AP, AE, AS, AT. He also offers some practical hints for the discipleship of each gift mix. This is a most comprehensive description and comes out of his ministry experience over more than twenty years. Dowsett's paper provided a solid base for understanding and listening to the interviewees in the current research.

⁶⁵ Mike Breen, *Building a Discipling Culture*, (Pawleys Island, SC: 3DM Publishing, 2009).

⁶⁶ Mike Breen, *Multiplying Missional Leaders*, (Pawleys Island, SC: 3DM Publishing, 2012).

⁶⁷ Mike Breen and Walt Kallestad, *A Passionate Life*, (Colorado Springs, CO: Nexgen, 2005)

⁶⁸ See appendix B.

⁶⁹ Andrew C. Dowsett, "Jesus-given: living the life you were called to be," <www.academia.edu/2339081/Jesus-given_living_the_life_you_were_called_to_be> (20 July 2016).

⁷⁰ Dowsett spent his early years in ministry with Mike Breen, rector and team leader of St Thomas' Church in Sheffield.

McNair Scott: “Making sense of contemporary Charismatic Apostolates” (A PhD thesis , 2012)⁷¹

Benjamin G McNair Scott begins his study with Michael Frost and Alan Hirsch’s call for a reformation of church structure⁷². He proceeds to research the contemporary understanding of apostolic ministry in this light. His survey includes the different understandings of the function of an apostle in various church streams across the globe today, some history in which he explains how the church has come to embrace this ministry and where it could be heading. The author is an Anglican priest serving in the Church of England. In his words, he is viewing his subject through an evangelical, protestant, catholic/ecumenical lens. His concern for scriptural integrity and consideration of the wider church makes his theological reflections pertinent to the current research.

The most relevant section of this work is his reflections on the pioneer ministry being done by the some members of the Anglican Church in the United Kingdom. McNair Scott concludes that there are good biblical and theological grounds for apostolic ministry and acknowledges that the cultural shift required to implement this kind of leadership on a wider scale will be a challenge for mainstream churches even though there is a growing acceptance of it.

⁷¹ Benjamin G. McNair Scott, “Making sense of Contemporary Charismatic Apostolates” (PhD thesis, King’s College, London, 2012).

⁷² Mike Frost and Alan Hirsch, *The Shaping of Things to Come: Innovation and Mission for the 21st Century Church* (Peabody: Hendrickson, 2003), 6.

2.3 Stories from Churches that have Changed

2.3.1 St Thomas', Sheffield and 3D Movements (or 3DM)

Under the leadership of Mike Breen, St Thomas'⁷³ in Sheffield, England, began a journey of experimenting with different discipleship tools. The model they used was successful and has now been exported to many countries across the world including Australia and New Zealand and is being used across denominational and non-denominational churches.

The vision of 3DM is “to change the world by putting discipleship and mission back into the hands of everyday people.”⁷⁴ The values of 3D Movements are:⁷⁵

1. Jesus as the Model -because the way of Jesus is as important as his words and works,
2. Family at the Core -because who we are becoming is as important as what we are doing,
3. Life on the Edge -because leaders by definition are the ones who go first,
4. Listening for the Word -as becoming like Jesus is a journey of both Spirit and Truth,
5. Celebrating along the Way- because purpose and play make the family work.

This model uses the language developed in LifeShapes, including APEST ministries, and missional communities and is therefore particularly relevant to the current research as it was developed in an Anglican environment and the Nelson Diocese became involved in this training in 2015 has begun to take advantage of this training.

Mike Breen testifies to his experience of releasing the fivefold ministries.⁷⁶

I believe that Ephesians 4 teaches that there are five ministries and that every member of the church has been given one of them. In other words, everyone who is a Christian is an apostle, or a prophet, or an evangelist, or a teacher, or a pastor.

I have come to this position for two reasons. The first is that the text itself seems to suggest such an understanding. The second is that, as I have applied this teaching to people in the churches I have seen a remarkable release of life, growth and spiritual power.

⁷³ St Thomas is an Anglican and Baptist Church. Alex Absalom, also an apostolic gifting, was connected to this church before he too moved to the USA. His resources can be found online under Dandelion Resourcing.

⁷⁴ < <https://3dmovements.com/about> > (1 Nov 2017)

⁷⁵ Ibid.

⁷⁶ Mike Breen, *The Apostle's Notebook* (Eastbourne: Kingsway Communications, 2002), 148-149.

2.3.2 Rivertree Christian Church, Ohio⁷⁷

From 2011 to 2015 Alex Absalom, who previously worked alongside Mike Breen in Sheffield, joined the staff of Rivertree, a non-denominational multi-site church of approximately three thousand members in Ohio. His focus was to work with the church staff to introduce a disciple making culture and to establish missional communities. The Rivertree Church still follows the model developed by Absalom.

2.3.3 Alan Hirsch, South Melbourne Restoration Community

Around 2000 the South Melbourne Restoration Community restructured their leadership team to ensure all five APEST ministries were represented. At the time this structural change is credited with moving the community towards being a more missional church. Five teams were formed representing each gift. These teams were allocated areas of responsibility that related to their giftings, for example, the apostolic team was delegated mission and strategy, the prophetic team were focussed on discerning what God was saying and social justice issues, meanwhile the evangelistic team was responsible for evangelism and outreach, the pastoral team worked on building community, pastoral care, cell groups and counselling while the teaching team took up the challenge of creating contexts where people were encouraged to engage in bible study. Some years after Hirsch left this church, it reverted to a more inherited style of organisation so the long term fruit of this experimental use of APEST cannot be evaluated but it does highlight the importance of having continuity in leadership to embed a new culture in a church.

⁷⁷ Alex Absalom is known personally by the author. Also see <http://dandelionresourcing.com/who/> Cited 17 March 2017.

Chapter 3

Biblical Framework

3.1 Exegesis of Ephesians 4:7-13

⁷ *But each of us was given grace according to the measure of Christ's gift.*

⁸ *Therefore it is said, "When he ascended on high he made captivity itself a captive; he gave gifts to his people."*

⁹ *(When it says, "He ascended," what does it mean but that he had also descended into the lower parts of the earth?*

¹⁰ *He who descended is the same one who ascended far above all the heavens, so that he might fill all things.)*

¹¹ *The gifts he gave were that some would be apostles, some prophets, some evangelists, some pastors and teachers,*

¹² *to equip the saints for the work of ministry, for building up the body of Christ,*

¹³ *until all of us come to the unity of the faith and of the knowledge of the Son of God, to maturity, to the measure of the full stature of Christ. (NRSV)*

Introduction

In Ephesians 4:11-12 Paul speaks of apostles, prophets, evangelists, pastors and teachers, gifts given by the ascended Christ to equip the saints for the work of ministry and for building up the body of Christ. All three liturgies for the ordination of bishops, priests and deacons in *A New Zealand Prayer Book* include these verses claiming a connection between these five gifts, the three clerical orders and church leadership. Over recent years these gifts have been gaining renewed attention. Questions are being raised about the nature, place and function of these gifts, especially apostles and prophets. Traditionally scholars have understood the apostle, prophet, evangelist, pastor and teacher to be gifted ministers who Christ gave to the church to train the people to exercise their own ministries. By reading this passage through an alternative lens a much wider view of these gifts can be argued, one that requires a major paradigm shift for the church. The gifts Christ gave to the church are not only those in ministry leadership roles but include every believer. The purpose of the gifts is to enable the whole body of Christ to mature and be all that Jesus intends us to be. The five different gifts are five dimensions of Jesus' ministry which will continue to be expressed through the whole body of Christ working together. As this potential is realised, trained and released a reinvigorated church, working together for the extension of kingdom of God, will emerge.

Ephesians is a general epistle, a letter Paul⁷⁸ wrote to the believers in Ephesus, probably while he was in prison in Rome. In his letters to the churches in Galatia, Corinth and Colossae Paul was writing to deal with particular local issues. This letter is different. There does not appear to be any problem in this church. There is no indication that the letter is addressed to the church leaders or any named recipient so it is thought to be a circular letter about church issues, written with an expectation that it would be read and passed around the other churches in Asia Minor.

The letter to the Colossians and the letter to the Ephesians share many similarities. Both identify the author as Paul, an apostle of Christ Jesus and both are known as prison letters that were delivered to their recipients by Tychicus. Although there is disagreement over dates, they are both thought to have been written about 60-61AD in Rome. They share common themes of Christ and his church but were written for different purposes. Colossians is Christological with an emphasis on the supremacy of Christ over all things and addresses heresies that had made their way into the church. Ephesians is ecclesiological in nature. Paul teaches about the church and how it should function with an emphasis on the unity of the body of Christ and its growth to full maturity, to be like Christ. Paul is living out his calling, to bring news of Christ to the Gentiles and exhorts his readers to live out their own calling. Paul also addresses the Gentiles and urges them to be reconciled with the Jewish people, for Jew and Gentile are one in Christ and together form a new household of God built upon the foundation of the apostles and prophets, with Christ Jesus himself as the cornerstone (2:11-22).

Structurally Ephesians divides into two halves: chapters 1-3, which are theological in nature and chapters 4-6, which are practical with life application. Ephesians 4:1-16, the connecting passage is divided into two paragraphs. In the first Paul makes a plea for unity in the body of Christ (v 1-6). He employs the sevenfold use of 'one' to underline his point: one body, one Spirit, one hope, one Lord, one faith, one baptism, and one God. In the second paragraph he contrasts this unity with the diversity of gifts given by Christ but to be used for the benefit of all and to equip the whole body to perform the work they have been called to (v7-13). In the final verses of this paragraph (v14-16)

⁷⁸ Although Paul is named as the author (1:1, 3:1) and Pauline authorship was accepted by the early church and until late eighteenth century, the majority of contemporary scholars refute Paul's authorship. Peter T. O'Brien, *The Letter to the Ephesians*, PNTC (Nottingham: Apollos. 1999), 4.

Paul's concern is for the purpose of the gifts: to bring maturity to the body of Christ, a maturity that he defines as bearing the likeness of Christ.

Verse by Verse Analysis

V7-8

Having urged his readers to maintain the unity of the Spirit Paul begins this section by picking up the theme in v 4-6 with *heni*, one, but this time with a slight change in meaning. Instead of 'oneness', as in the previous verses, he uses *heni* in the sense of 'individuality'⁷⁹. Who are these gifts for? Paul, recognising that others are called as he is called, includes himself saying *hekastō hēmōn*, each of us, each individual member of the body has received a gift and to emphasize his point he echoes this at the end of the passage in v16, "as each part is working properly." However, the call for unity does not imply uniformity. Paul contrasts the unity in the earlier verses with diversity in the form of a variety of gifts. The variety of gifts are to be used for the benefit of the whole body. Each individual person has been given *charis*, grace, not in equal amounts, but according to the measure Christ has chosen to give each one. These are gifts, they cannot be earned. It is Christ who determines which gift each individual receives and the extent of the empowerment given. It has been suggested the NIV rendering "as Christ apportioned it" might also indicate the five gifts are not given in equal numbers; there are different proportions of the ministries in the church. For example, there seems to be many pastors and teachers but fewer apostles, prophets and evangelists.⁸⁰

Instead of moving directly to the list of Christ's gifts Paul first takes the reader on a detour returning to the gifts in v11. There must be a reason he did this; an insight he wants the readers to grasp. With 'therefore it is said' Paul begins v8 with a quotation from scripture. He expected his audience to recognise similarities between this verse and Ps 68:18.

Ps 68:18 (NIV)

¹⁸ When you ascended on high,
you took many captives;
you received gifts from people.

⁷⁹ Clinton E. Arnold, *Ephesians*, ECNT (Grand Rapids: Zondervan, 2010), 246.

⁸⁰ Mike Breen, *The Apostle's Notebook*, 158.

Eph 4:8 (NIV) ⁸ This is why it says:
 ‘When he ascended on high,
 he took many captives
 and gave gifts to his people.’

There are two textual differences; the first simply a change from second to third person but the second has been the subject of debate. Paul says in Eph 4:8 that gifts were given to his people rather than received from people as was stated in the original psalm.⁸¹

Some versions translate the last line in v8 “and gave gifts to men” but *anthrōpos*, men, is also the generic term for humankind including both men and women.

Psalm 68 has been described as a “processional liturgy celebrating the glorious and triumphal rule of Israel’s God.”⁸² In the opening verse the psalmist is calling out in prayer asking God to rise up, as he has done before on Israel’s behalf, and scatter their enemies. In poetic form the psalm moves across the history of God’s people from the days of the exodus (v1-6) to the wilderness period (v7-10), the conquest of Canaan (v8-14) and the arrival at Mt Zion (v15-18). God who ascends Mt Zion (v17-18) is depicted as the warrior king, Father and protector (v5), liberator (v6) and provider (v10). Israel’s God is like no other. The picture is of a victorious king who after defeating the enemy is leading a triumphant procession, ascending Mt Zion bringing with him people who have been taken captive from the enemy’s camp (v18) as well as the spoils of war which were given as gifts to the people (v12). In Eph 4:8 the term for gifts is *doma*. It is not common in the New Testament but is used of a father giving good gifts to his children (Matt 7:11).

This still leaves the question about the textual variation in the quotation over the giving and receiving of gifts. Paul would not have deliberately changed the words to suit his purpose. He may have had in mind the victorious king receiving gifts from the defeated enemy and then giving those gifts to his own people in which case the meaning is consistent and ties in with Ps 68:12. Another explanation is that Paul was quoting from an alternative text. The Syraic translation of the Psalms reads “...and you gave gifts to the sons of men.”⁸³ The Aramaic Targum reads “... you gave them as gifts to the sons of

⁸¹ The parallel verses are not as clear in the NRSV.

⁸² NIV Study Bible notes.

⁸³ Arnold, *Ephesians*, 251.

man”⁸⁴ however as Ephesians is thought to predate this document it is less likely Paul is quoting from this.⁸⁵

So why did Paul choose to quote Ps 68:18? He was setting the scene with a biblical picture of a victorious king giving gifts to his people. In Ephesians Paul is more concerned with spiritual enemies, the principalities and powers that come against people (Eph 6:12).⁸⁶ He now makes the connection and identifies the ascended Christ as the victorious King who through his death and resurrection, defeated the enemy (Col 2:15), the principalities and powers of darkness including the power of sin and death. Christ then ascended into heaven taking with him the spoils of his victory, people who the enemy had held captive but have now been liberated (Eph 2:6). The expression *eichmalóteuó aichmalōsian*, “to take captive captivity” is more simply “he captured a multitude of captives.” Jesus took with him those who were in captivity, setting free people who had been bound in sin by the enemy. As the victor, the ascended Jesus now gives back those he has freed from captivity as gifts to the body of Christ. There is an earlier biblical parallel to this receiving and giving with God “receiving the Levites as a gift, then giving them back to his people.”⁸⁷

Taking an even wider view it has been suggested that the gifts are not given at the moment of conversion but are given to us when we were created.⁸⁸ Jesus then “redeems what is already present in the world and realigns it, giving it a new theological significance and function within the church.”⁸⁹ This is supported in scripture; “we are what he made us, created in Christ Jesus for good works...” (Eph 2:10) and “before I formed you in the womb I knew you...” (Jer 1:5)

There are other interpretations of verses 7-8. Ancient Jewish interpreters saw this verse as a reference to Moses ascending to heaven to receive the Torah from God.⁹⁰ Captivity was the Torah, the gifts were the law but the law came from God not the people. A third view says the first century Jews may have understood these verses as applying to the

⁸⁴ Ibid., 251.

⁸⁵ Ibid., 249.

⁸⁶ Ibid., 247.

⁸⁷ Peter T. O’Brien, *The Letter to the Ephesians*, PNTC (Nottingham: Apollos, 1999), 293.

⁸⁸ Alan Hirsch and Tim Catchim, *The Permanent Revolution* (San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 2012), 8-10.

⁸⁹ Ibid.

⁹⁰ Frank Thielman, *Ephesians*, BENTC (Grand Rapids: Baker, 2010), 265.

Exodus and Israel's freedom from slavery in Egypt, followed by Moses' ascension of Mt Sinai and descending again with the stone tablets with the Torah.⁹¹ A "new Exodus" achieved through the death, resurrection and ascension of Jesus after which "Jesus returned in the person of the 'Spirit', through whom different gifts are now showered on the church."⁹² However this requires the ascending to precede the descending and contrary to the meaning of v10 which says Christ fills all things from heaven.⁹³

V9-10

Paul now offers his explanation. By "*He ascended*", Paul is referring to Jesus' ascension into heaven. The rhetorical question "what does it mean ...?" indicates that he expected his readers to know the answer. Jesus was the one who "*had also descended*" to earth. He existed as the Word before his incarnation (John1:14). There is also the sense that Jesus "descended" by humbling himself by leaving heaven and being born into a human body.⁹⁴ However "*the lower parts of the earth*" is not clear to the reader today but an alternative translation "the earth below" had been suggested.⁹⁵ Another suggestion is "the earth and the grave" which makes sense since Jesus lived and died as a perfect man after which he ascended defeating all his enemies. If Paul meant Jesus descended to the earth, he could have simply said that.

Paul would have been speaking clearly to the people of his day, so how might they have understood these words? The early fathers understood it to be a reference to the underworld or the realm of the dead where spiritual powers were thought to be located and connected to Jesus visiting those who had died (1 Pet 3:19).⁹⁶ However, Paul refers to the spiritual powers being located in the heavens (Eph 6:12).

Alternatively it was Jesus who ascended but the Spirit who descended at Pentecost.⁹⁷ Against this argument is v10 which states that "*He who descended is the same one who*

⁹¹ Tom Wright, *Paul for Everyone: The Prison Letters: Ephesians, Philippians, Colossians and Philemon* 2nd ed. (London: SPCK, 2004), 45.

⁹² Ibid.

⁹³ O'Brien, *The Letter to the Ephesians*, 296.

⁹⁴ John R.W. Stott, *The Message of Ephesians*, BST (Downers Grove: IVP, 1979), 157.

⁹⁵ O'Brien, *The Letter to the Ephesians*, 294.

⁹⁶ NIV Study Bible notes.

⁹⁷ O'Brien, *The Letter to the Ephesians*, 294.

⁹⁸ Arnold, *Ephesians*, 253.

ascended.” It is more likely that Paul is placing emphasis on the extent of Christ’s reign by saying he “*descended into the lower parts of the earth*” and then “*ascended far above all the heavens*” and the purpose “*so that he might fill all things.*” Paul is emphasizing there is nowhere that Christ’s rule cannot reach. It may have reassured any people of the day who feared the underworld or the grave knowing Christ’s power was not limited in any way.

V11

Paul now returns his main focus to the gifts, given to each one of us and to the giver of the gifts, the ascended Christ. He names the gifts as apostles, prophets, evangelists, pastors and teachers. The gifts given are people-gifts,⁹⁸ people who have been set free by Christ. The tense of the verb *edothē*, given, in v7 and v11 indicates that the gifts “are given, once and for all but with clear and abiding significance, to the church...We cannot eliminate or downplay one of these ministries without undermining the legitimacy, significance, and vitality of the others.”⁹⁹ Many scholars, including Arnold, Thielman and O’Brien, look at these verses through the lens of the present day church institution with its hierarchical structure and fail “to recognise the movemental nature of ecclesia in the New Testament”¹⁰⁰ making an assumption that these gifts are a few chosen people in church leadership,¹⁰¹ rather than for everyone. However this letter gives no indication of being addressed to leadership; it is addressed to the whole church. There is no reason why v7-12 should not be understood as being written to everyone since, both before and after this section, the whole church is being addressed concerning unity in the body (v1-6) and maturity in the body (v13-16). The implication is that every person has been given a calling grace to be one of these gifts.

The apostle is listed first. When Ephesians was written *apostolos*, apostle, was in common usage for a representative, messenger or envoy who was sent by a person in authority and given permission to act on behalf of the sender. The common verb, *apostello*, means to send out. Although *apostolos* is used frequently in the New Testament it is mostly referring to the twelve Jesus first chose as his disciples and who later as apostles had a foundational role in the church (2:20, 3:5). It is argued that this

⁹⁸ This is a term used by Andrew Dowsett to distinguish them from activity-gifts.

⁹⁹ Hirsch and Catchim, *The Permanent Revolution*, 20.

¹⁰⁰ Ibid., 21.

¹⁰¹ Arnold, *Ephesians*, 255. Thielman, *Ephesians*, 273. O’Brien, *The Letter to the Ephesians*, 297.

may form the basis of the reluctance in some churches to accept current day apostolic ministry. However, there are also other apostles named in scripture e.g. Paul, Barnabas (Acts 4:36), Andronicus and Junias (Rom 16:7), Epaphroditus (Phil 2:25)¹⁰², Silvanus and Timothy (1 Thes 2:6) and some unnamed ones (2 Cor 8:23). Some writers find it helpful to use a capital letter to distinguish the original twelve, as Apostles, from the others, as apostles.¹⁰³ This passage speaks of apostles being given to the church after Jesus' ascension but gives no indication that the gift of apostle (or prophet) would cease after the first century leaving the body of Christ to function with only the other three gifts. The gift of apostle is still being given today but without the authority of the original Twelve or Paul who had a unique calling. So what might an apostle look like? Jesus is the model apostle; he was sent by the Father into the world (John 3:17) and is both our Apostle and High Priest (Heb 3:1).

Second Paul lists the prophet, one who hears and speaks on God's behalf. The role of the *prophētēs*, prophet, is well known in the Old Testament. The prophet functioned as God's mouthpiece and called the people back to covenantal faithfulness. They carried authority from God with some of their words recorded as scripture. It is not surprising that *prophētēs* is mostly used when referring to Old Testament prophets or their prophetic books. With the coming of the Spirit the New Testament role of prophet is different. Only a few New Testament prophets are identified as such. Agabus predicted a severe famine (Acts 11:28) and Paul's arrest (Acts 21:11). At Antioch Barnabas, Simeon, Lucius, Manean and Saul are recognised as prophets and teachers (Acts 13:1). Paul connects apostles with prophets when he speaks of building on the foundation of the apostles and prophets (Eph 2:20). He lays an order for building; first apostles, second prophets, third teachers (1Cor 12:28-29). Paul also speaks of the Spirit revealing things to God's holy apostles and prophets (Eph 3:5). Prophets are still needed to call God's people back to God's purposes. To do what the Father is calling us to do we all need to be equipped to hear his voice and feel his heart. Jesus perfectly modelled the role of prophet. Praying to his Father he said "I gave them the words you gave me" (John 17:8).

¹⁰² This is translated as "messenger" in the NIV.

¹⁰³ Hirsch and Catchim, *The Permanent Revolution*, 99.

The evangelist, one who brings good news, is the third gift. The *euangelistēs*, evangelist or preacher of the gospel, only gets a mention twice in the New Testament. Phillip is described as an evangelist (Acts 21:8). Timothy is exhorted to do the work of an evangelist (2 Tim 4:5). However the gospel or good news, *euangelion*, and the related verb *euangelizō*, to preach the good news or gospel, are both very common. The biblical emphasis is on the message and the act of speaking the message rather than the person. Jesus perfectly fulfilled the role of an evangelist. He said, "I must preach the good news of the kingdom of God to the other towns also, because that is why I was sent" (Luke 4:43).

The pastor is one who shepherds God's people, nurturing and protecting the community of faith, leading them to healing and wholeness. Confusion arises between this context and when "pastor" is used as a title for a position in church leadership or specialist role such as "youth pastor" or "children's pastor." Ephesians 4:11 is the only time *poimēn* is translated "pastor," it is usually "shepherd," a motif the original hearers would identify with from both the scriptures, for example, the Shepherd of Israel (Ps 80:1) and their social context. Jesus is called the great shepherd (Heb 13:20) and the shepherd and overseer (1 Pet 2:25). To avoid the connotation of church leadership commonly attached to "pastor" I have followed Hirsch's suggestion by using "shepherd" instead resulting in the acronym APEST rather than APEPT for the Ephesians 4 gifts. The ESV has adopted "shepherd" although most bible translations continue to use "pastor."

The fifth gift *didaskalos*, teacher, is also one we are familiar with. Jesus is often called Teacher in the gospels but the term is only used a few times of others in scripture. The *didaskalos* is one who provides instruction but also implies having authority over students or followers. The teacher's role is to teach people God's truth and to help them to live it out in their lives. A distinction is made between *didaskalos*, teachers and *grammateus*, teachers of the law or scribes. We know there were prophets and teachers at Antioch (Acts 13:1) and Paul was appointed a herald and an apostle and a teacher (2 Tim 1:11). Again Jesus is our perfect model of a teacher and was often called Rabbi, a title for a teacher.

There is textual debate centred on this verse. Are there four or five gifts? In particular is pastor-teacher one gift or two? The Greek text reads "*kai autos edōken tous men*

apostolos tous de prophētēs tous de euangelistas tous de poimēn kai didaskalos.” The argument centres on the use of *tous* before each gift except *didaskalos*¹⁰⁴ which is instead preceded by *kai*. Some say this is an example of where the Granville Sharp's Rule¹⁰⁵ infers the pastor and teacher are found in the same person. Others maintain the rule only applies for two singular nouns. For the purpose of this study it is sufficient to recognise a close association between the distinct gifts of pastor and teacher.¹⁰⁶ A debate arises when “pastor” is used in the sense of a church leader and scripture says a church leader needs to be able to teach well. Experience tells me that while pastoral leadership and teaching gifts are often found together it is not difficult to find examples where this is not the case. However this passage is not about leadership but gifts for ministry or service in which case the debate is of little practical consequence. There remains a question of leadership. There will be some among each of the five ministry gifts who also have leadership gifts distinct from ministry gifts and so may be called to fulfil leadership roles, a calling within a calling.¹⁰⁷ There will be situations where it is advantageous to have an apostle or prophet or evangelist as leader. Other situations will be better suited to the leadership of a pastor or teacher.

V12

Having named the five gifts in v12 Paul now explains the purpose for the gifts. The first purpose is for the *katartismos*, equipping or preparation (NIV) or perfecting (NKJV) of the saints. This is the only time this noun occurs in the New Testament, however, its medical use refers to straightening or setting a joint or broken bone,¹⁰⁸ ensuring the bones are in correct alignment to mend so that the body will be able function as it was designed to function and “each part is working properly...” Given the imagery of the body of Christ this equipping has the intended purpose of enabling the believers to function in unity and mature to the point that the character and ministry of Christ will be manifested among them. Since Jesus is the perfect model for each of the five gifts,

¹⁰⁴ A discussion of this can be found in Arnold, 260 and in Thielman, 275.

¹⁰⁵ Daniel B. Wallace, *Greek Grammar: Beyond the Basics* (Grand Rapids: Zondervan, 1996), 271.

Granville Sharp's rule states: When the copulative KAI connects two nouns of the same case... if the article HO or any of its cases, precedes the first of the said nouns or participles, and is not repeated before the second noun or participle, the latter always relates to the same person that is expressed or described by the first noun or participle; i.e., it denotes a further description of the first-named person. The rule is applied absolutely only to personal, singular, non-proper nouns.

¹⁰⁶ Hirsch and Catchim, *The Permanent Revolution*, 22.

¹⁰⁶ O'Brien, *The Letter to the Ephesians*, 300.

¹⁰⁸ Thielman, *Ephesians*, 279.

together the mature body of Christ will manifest the ministry of Jesus. The related verb, *katartizō* can help explain the meaning. New Testament examples are “being fully trained” (Luke 6:40), “mending nets” (Matt 4:21) and “perfectly united” (1 Cor 1:10). The imagery of “mending nets” is better captured by “preparing” or “restoring” nets getting them ready to be used for their intended purpose.

Secondly *diakonia*, ministry, carries a sense of serving and is more often translated as service, work or task. Since in contemporary church culture “ministry” carries a more professional connotation, “works of service” (NIV) may better convey the meaning. Everyone is called to serve in whatever way they are gifted.

As the Greek text has no punctuation the intended meaning of this verse is not clear. One interpretation has contributed to a clergy and laity distinction. In the KJV a comma was inserted after ‘saints’ implying the role of the apostles, prophets, evangelists, pastors and teachers is threefold:

1. for the perfecting of the saints,
2. for the work of ministry and
3. for edifying the body of Christ.

However newer translations have looked again at the Greek and removed the comma implying a twofold role leading to a different interpretation. A better rendering is¹⁰⁹

1. for the equipping the saints for the work of service,
2. for the building up the body of Christ.

It is the task of all the saints to do the work of ministry or service! The end result will be the body of Christ is encouraged and strengthened. This is a huge paradigm shift after years of professional ministry and largely passive saints. The debate continues. Some say the first view is just an attempt to remove clericalism in favour of a more popular democratic approach.¹¹⁰

The traditional view of this verse is that the apostle, prophet, evangelist, pastor and teacher are a chosen few called to leadership roles and given the task of equipping the saints.¹¹¹ There is no indication in the text that these verses are directed to leadership.

¹⁰⁹ Arnold, *Ephesians*, 244.

¹¹⁰ O’Brien, *The Letter to the Ephesians*, 302.

¹¹¹ O’Brien, 297-298. Arnold, 255. Thielman, 273.

So if each member of the body of Christ has been given grace to minister in one of the five dimensions, who then does the equipping? The term “equipper” is sometimes used of a person who fulfils a role as a trainer but equipping can also be understood as informal learning as believers help each other grow. Paul seems to be indicating that the saints can both learn from each other and help each other mature. They can be both learners and teachers as in life generally. The APEST gifts are distributed among the saints so that all the saints can help equip all the saints. The western education model functions largely with a teacher/ minister who has the knowledge and students/congregation who need to learn. If equipping is viewed through an apprenticeship lens instead it would look different. Most learning in the physical, social, emotional and practical areas of life occurs as we share life in community with those around us rather than in a classroom setting. It is within the community that learning occurs and is often caught more than taught. Those who are more mature or have received a greater capacity will have more to give so in no way will specialist ministries such as bible teachers be replaced. Their ministry will encourage and empower the saints to continue growing by incarnating their learning into their lives. The movemental model of church that is seeing rapid growth around the world works from this premise, trusting the Holy Spirit to work it out.¹¹² The consequence of only a few people being viewed as capable of equipping is the creation of a culture of perpetual immaturity in the body. How does a believer move from ‘being equipped’ to ‘being an equipper? This is precisely the problem faced in many churches today. Jesus trained his disciples to continue his ministry in three years yet some of the saints have been equipped for years but remain passive in faith and practice.

V13

Having expounded on the gifts given by the ascended Christ for building up the whole body of believers, Paul turns his focus to the end objective. The verb *katantēsōmen*, come has the sense of reach (NIV) or attain (NASB) a goal. So Paul is calling the whole body to serve until the whole body has reached the goal. He has in mind three things. The first, that revisits “one faith” in v5, is unity of the faith and of the knowledge of the Son of God. Paul wants them all to be well grounded in the teaching of their faith but especially to know who Jesus is. Paul’s use of the title “Son of God” is unusual. Paul

¹¹² T4T is an example of this kind of Church Planting Movement.

may be stressing Jesus in his exalted and empowered role.¹¹³ He could be emphasizing his eternal sonship, from 1:3-4.¹¹⁴ The second part of the goal is to reach maturity. The Greek is *andra teleion*, a man fully-grown as distinct from a boy. Paul is using “man” for the corporate body of believers. He is calling for them to be “perfect” (NKJV) or “mature” (NIV). The third part of the goal is what they are aiming for “the measure of the full stature of Christ.” Maturity for the body of Christ looks like Christ, the head of the body, in both character and ministry.

Conclusion

When Paul exhorted his readers to live a life worthy of their calling, he is not just speaking of their primary calling as disciples of the ascended Jesus, as Lord and King. He is also challenging each person to recognise and live out their own unique calling for ministry. Every believer is a gift from the ascended Christ to the church. The work of ministry is not to be restricted to leaders or a few special people. Ephesians 4:7-13 makes it clear that every believer receives at least one of these five ministry gifts but with differing levels of empowerment. Whether one is gifted as an apostle, a prophet, an evangelist, a pastor or a teacher the purpose of the gift is to ensure that all believers are equipped and fully prepared for their work of service. In this way the whole body of Christ will be built up until it becomes a mature expression of Jesus in every way.

So, from the words of Paul, apostle, prophet, evangelist, pastor and teacher are not positions to be filled but people gifts given for ministry and the equipping others. Each one of us has been called, Jesus as King has set us free that together all the saints will come to a unity and maturity. During his earthly life Jesus perfectly expressed the ministry associated with each of these five gifts. He was the model apostle, prophet, evangelist, pastor and teacher. In the present day the church, as the body of Christ, is to represent Jesus to the world. When the five gifts are functioning together in love and unity the church will not only be one in faith and reflect the character of Jesus but will have a life and vitality that expresses the five dimensions of the ministry of Jesus to the broken world. This is the mission of God that we are invited to participate in.

¹¹³ Arnold, *Ephesians*, 264. Other examples are Rom 1:4 and Gal 2:20.

¹¹⁴ Ibid., 256.

3.2 Spiritual Gifts and Leadership

In the past twenty years spiritual gift teaching has become common but many tests, including online tests, combine all the gifts together without making reference to the context in which each passage was written. There is a great diversity of gifts mentioned in scripture. There are twenty distinct gifts in Romans 12:6-8, 1 Corinthians 12: 4-11 and Ephesians 4:11. Sometimes 1 Peter 4:10-11 is included with its two broad gift categories of teaching and serving. Hospitality, martyrdom, celibacy etc. can also be added to these lists. Natural talents like music, dance, art and craft form another layer. It is not hard to identify gifts that are not listed.

Some commentaries on Ephesians assume the gifts in Eph 4, Rom 12 and 1 Cor 12 are similar in nature and purpose, all being gifts of grace to be used for the benefit of the body. Two similar terms are used, *charisma*, gift (Rom 12:6, 1 Cor 12:4) and *charis*, grace (Eph 4:7). There is an understanding that the lists are not complete. However, looking closely at each of these three passages uncovers differences that show these gifts are not to be viewed as similar.

1 Corinthians 12:4-11

Paul wrote 1 Corinthians to the young church in Corinth. The new converts had a pagan past with a history of idol worship. Paul writes to help sort out some problems in their corporate gatherings where there appears to have been a competitive attitude in the use of gifts. In this context he turns to another issue, “Now concerning *pneumatikos*, spiritual gifts...” (12:1). “Gifts” is not in the original text. The Greek, *pneumatikos* can be either an adjective or a noun; a spiritual person, spiritual things or spirituality, but is usually translated as spiritual gifts. Paul continues to list nine **manifestations** (*phanerōsis*) given by the **Spirit** that are to be used for the common good (12:7-10). These gifts or manifestations are available to every believer as a consequence of the indwelling of the Spirit of God.

Romans 12:6-8

Paul wrote his letter to the church in Rome when the believers were struggling with the relationship between the Jewish and Gentile believers. He says “For just as each of us

has one body with many members, and these members do not all have the same **function** (*praxis*)... He is asking them to work together, using the gifts they have, for the common good (Rom 12:4). He continues by listing the gifts as actions. For example, “If your gift is prophesying, then prophesy...” (v7). His concern is that the people use their gifts for the benefit of all.

Ephesians 4:11

Ephesians is a general letter to the churches. There is no crisis to address. Paul begins in verse 1 saying “I... beseech you to walk worthy of the calling (*klēsis*) with which you were called (*kaleō*). These gifts, given by **Jesus** to the body, are people: apostles, prophets, evangelists, pastors and teachers. The gifts are people gifts.¹¹⁵ The term *kaleō* can also carry the sense of being named. Paul “connects the being with the doing: task and person are the same. It becomes a sense of vocational identity.”¹¹⁶ Each person is given a different measure of empowerment. As the person matures to become more like Jesus there will be growth in the ability to function in other ministry areas but the calling each has received will be the best fit, the most natural and fruitful area of ministry.

Hirsch and Catchim compare the gifts in these three passages.¹¹⁷

1 Corinthians 12	<i>phanerōsis</i> / manifestation (of the Spirit)	situational
Romans 12	<i>praxis</i> / action	practical
Ephesians 4	<i>klēsis</i> / calling (people gifts given by Jesus)	vocational

We can understand how these gifts function together by first considering a person’s calling. To fulfill that calling the person will need to access the other gifts at different times as needed. For example a teacher may need discernment or a gift of wisdom for a task they are doing. The 1 Corinthians 12 gifts can be thought of as a tool box, available to a believer, as required.

¹¹⁵ Dowsett calls these people gifts as distinct from activity gifts in the other passages.

¹¹⁶ Hirsch and Catchim, *The Permanent Revolution*, 25.

¹¹⁷ Ibid., 24.

Leadership Gifts

The New Testament church was responsible for appointing leaders, such as overseers or bishops, elders and deacons, from among themselves. Paul gave the churches guidelines for making these appointments such as godly character and life style and an ability to manage their own household (Tit 1:6-7, 1Tim3:2-7). These appointed leaders could have a calling in any of the five ministry gifts given by the ascended Christ. Within each calling, Hirsch offers a helpful differentiation between gifting, ministry and leadership.¹¹⁸ Everyone has a gift that grows into a ministry but for some there will be an empowerment that leads to the person being recognised as having an ability to equip others to a greater degree¹¹⁹ whether or not that person is in a church leadership position. It is dependent on the measure of the enabling.

¹¹⁸ Ibid., 21-22.

¹¹⁹ Ibid., 22.

Chapter 4

Research Design and Methods

This chapter outlines my research methodology explaining the process used and the reasons for the decisions made. Included is a discussion of the sample selection, the research instrument employed and the interview process. Finally I will outline the approach used to analyse the data received.

Permission to conduct interviews with ministry leaders was sought and granted from the University of Otago Research Ethics Committee.

A mixed method approach was used as this research project involved collecting data from two time periods, the present day and historical, 1991-2010. The present day research required the collection of mostly qualitative data i.e. ideas and understandings that are not easily quantified. A survey was suitable as answers were being sought for ‘what?’, ‘where?’, ‘when?’ and ‘how?’ questions rather than ‘why?’ questions.¹²⁰ Historical data was gleaned from Diocese of Nelson synod documents and church attendance records from 1990-2017. This was followed by interviews with the parish consultant and a vicar of a parish during the decade from 1990-2000.

Instrument

A semi-structured interview was used for the survey. A list of questions was prepared as a starting point to ensure that important themes were consistent and covered within the interview time allowance of approximately one hour. This method also had the advantage of making data processing easier since everyone began by answering the same questions and ensured the breadth of enquiry was covered while also giving freedom to probe more deeply, clarify a question, seek clarification of an answer when needed and redirect any interviewee who moved off the subject. The face-to-face contact with the interviewee also encouraged their engagement with the investigation. Alternative instruments that could have been used were a written questionnaire or an unstructured interview. A written questionnaire on its own had the potential to lead to

¹²⁰ Bell, Judith, *Doing your Research Project*, 5th ed. (Open University Press, Maidenhead, 2010), 12.

interpretation differences and misunderstandings since the Ephesians 4 passage this research is based on has had different interpretations over time. At the other end of the spectrum an unstructured interview would have gained interesting stories but might have bypassed the data needed making it difficult to make comparisons.

Sampling

For the main investigation a sample size of fourteen was deemed to be manageable in the time allowed. It was decided that random sampling was not appropriate because the topic had not been widely discussed in the diocese and the outcome could have been that little workable data was obtained. It was decided to select the sample from people in leadership positions in the Marlborough regional deanery for four reasons. Firstly it is the largest deanery in the diocese with eight of the twenty-four parishes and secondly there is a good mix of age and experience among the current leadership. My interviewees cover the full age range from early 30s to 65 and their experience covers the spectrum from new to ordained ministry leadership to 45 years experience in ministry. Thirdly some of the parishes have been working at developing a closer working relationship so they are responsive to looking for new ways of being church including working across traditional parish boundaries. My research is likely to have a more immediate benefit to these parishes. Lastly over the last three years ago I have preached a four week series on the APEST gifts in three of these parishes so there has been a growing discussion around the topic in the intervening years. Two of my interviewees have heard that sermon series and three others have read my notes.

The selected sample consisted of:

1. The eight parish leaders in Marlborough (vicar or priest-in-charge)
2. Four of the diocesan staff team who have ministry responsibility in the deanery in a specific area.
3. Two parachurch ministry leaders.

It was considered that this combination would provide a good balance and a workable sample size. The four diocesan staff selected had the most involvement with ministry units in Marlborough. One of the parachurch leaders lives in Marlborough and the other is an experienced Anglican lay evangelist who has worked nationally including in this diocese. The parachurch leaders were included because apostles, prophets and evangelists are known to gravitate to these bodies especially if they cannot find their ministry place in the local church and they were likely to bring a broader perspective.

Two of the parish clergy also have parachurch ministry experience. The sample included five women and nine men in total, three of whom are laity in full-time ministry. This combination is close to a representative sample of the diocesan leadership as a whole.

The magnitude 7.8 Kaikoura earthquake, 14th November 2016, occurred in the middle of the months in which the interviews were being conducted. It was decided that it was not appropriate to follow through with the interview of the Kaikoura minister when the community was dealing with an emergency that would consume time and energy for an extended period of time. Kaikoura was isolated for some months and access to the rest of Marlborough is not expected to be restored during the research period.

In August 2017 the parish consultant who worked in the diocese from 1991-2000 offered to have a conversation as part of this research. This was a valuable opportunity to seek his reflections on the learning from that decade, the reasons for both the growth and subsequent decline in church attendance over that period. Of particular interest to this paper was his assessment of the APEST gifting of the clergy in leadership at that time.

Interview Questions

Opening the interview it was appropriate to begin with the church's own definition of ordained ministry hence the first questions were based on the words found in the ordination liturgies in *A New Zealand Prayer Book*. All three ordination liturgies, bishops, priests and deacons, use the words of Eph 4:11-12. They are also used in the service for the induction of a vicar or priest-in-charge of a parish. The intention was to find out how each participant understood the connection between the APEST gifts as listed in scripture and the Anglican tradition of deacons, priests and bishops and how that works out in practice.

Also being sought was information about: individual gifting, training for ministry with its strengths and limitations, perceived obstacles to introducing an APEST culture, perceived obstacles in transitioning to a missional culture and future resourcing and training needs.

The Interviews

The potential interviewees selected were contacted by email and invited to participate. Along with the invitation each person was sent an information sheet explaining the research being undertaken and an outline of the interview process. Each participant was contacted to arrange a suitable time and place for an interview of approximately one hour. Prior to the interview appointment each interviewee was sent a consent form, a copy of the questions¹²¹ that would be asked and two different resource sheets that outlined definitions of the APEST gifts.¹²² This enabled them to have some time to prepare and think through their answers beforehand if they wanted to. I had previously indicated that extra questions might be added for clarification and probing if necessary.

Before commencing the interview the signed consent form was collected and permission was asked to make an audio recording of the interview. Interviews were transcribed at a later date. Two participants did not use a recorder, notes were taken instead. One participant needed to cancel our scheduled appointment at the last minute and it was not possible to reschedule. That participant emailed a very full written response. Another interviewee completed the last few questions by email when urgent work responsibilities interrupted the agreed interview time. Interviews were completed between August 2016 and December 2016 with the exception of a new minister who arrived in January 2017. That interview was completed in June 2017. All consent forms, notes, transcripts and recordings were kept in a secure place.

Analysis

The transcripts were all read through several times each to gain a sense of each response. Summary sheets were collated for each question to make comparing the data easier. The summary sheets were read through to gain an overall sense of the answers to each question. The questions were grouped together under themes. The names of the interviewees were coded.

Bias

Throughout this process I was conscious of my interest in this topic and possible bias. By recording most interviews I was able to revisit any comments I made and discard a

¹²¹ Appendix C.

¹²² Appendix A - Hirsch and Catchim and Appendix B - Absalom.

response if I had introduced a bias. Although the interviewees were known to me none were connected to me in an accountability structure so I am confident minimal if any bias was introduced. My husband is a vicar of one of the parishes and the regional dean of Marlborough but this role is for mentoring rather than part of the hierarchy. During the period of this research I was ordained to the diaconate and priesthood and licensed to the parish in a non-stipendiary assistant capacity.

Chapter 5

Summary of Findings

The aim of this research was to determine the current understanding of these gifts so that good decisions can be made going forward and the variety of gifts present in church leadership may be better used and strengthened as the leaders learn from and complement each other. To help answer the interview questions each participant was given a copy of appendix A and appendix B, two different attempts to describe the APEST gifts. This chapter summarises the responses received from the Anglican parish church leaders, diocesan ministry leaders and parachurch leaders interviewed.

1. How do you understand the gifts of apostle, prophet, evangelist, shepherd and teacher?

Apostle: The gift of apostle is the one people had the most difficulty identifying. Common descriptions included pioneer, initiator or someone who is pioneering a new project. Several picked up ideas like being a carrier of the big vision, giving oversight, extending the kingdom and strategizing. Other understandings mentioned were a person who was able to identify transferrable principles, one able to train and release the gifting of others and one primarily called to a ministry of teaching and prayer. Only one clergyperson picked up the cross-cultural aspect of this gift but it was recognised that this was not only applicable to overseas mission but also within New Zealand.

Prophet: Most understood the role of the prophet was to hear what God was saying and see where he is already working. Some saw a prophet's role as being within the church with responsibility for bringing about repentance, correct alignment, envisioning and building up the church. Others understood a prophet's role as functioning outside the church by being involved with social justice issues.

Evangelist: All understood the gift of evangelist as having the ability to share the gospel. Several saw the gift in a wider context of being able to draw people to Jesus Christ. Only one person emphasized this gift was not only for sharing the gospel but also for equipping every believer to share the gospel.

Shepherd: The gift of shepherd was mostly understood as the ministry of caring and in particular caring within the church community. Two respondents mentioned the importance of this gift for building community. Others recognised that shepherding was more than a status quo gift; it also involves challenging people to grow and seek healing in the widest sense, including emotional, spiritual, physical and relational health.

Teacher: The gift of teacher was understood by everyone as the ability to clearly teach and explain scripture but only one clearly differentiated teaching from the ability to communicate which can be found among each of the five ministry gifts. Explaining further, each gift was described as a lens that affects how each person sees things and consequently each brings a different focus to the teaching.

2. To what extent should we expect these gifts to be in operation today?

All participants agreed that all the gifts should be in use today. For one the interview had been the catalyst for him doing some reading and thinking around the subject. He acknowledged his research had caused him to change his views from a cessation theology stance to accepting their validity for today even to the point of questioning traditional clerical orders. Two others noted that although the church assents to the validity of all the gifts, in practice they were not usually looked for. One clergyperson was more direct in saying the church preferred the ministry of evangelists, shepherds and teachers, as prophets and apostles were understood to be too challenging. On the other hand it was observed that the ministry of the prophet was much needed today. It was also suggested that while the gifts are in operation because we have a limited view of them we often do not recognise the form in which they come. An example of this would be recognising prophets who are artists and speaking through a different medium.

3. How do you understand the phrase “to equip God’s people for their work of ministry?”

All understood “their work of ministry” to be all that people were involved within life but one went further and indicated they expected all Christians to be making disciples themselves. Others expressed their understanding of this phrase as they expected God’s people to be continuing the ministry of Jesus by “releasing the captives.” One church leader had already organised his church’s ministry around the five APEST areas. At the

other end of the spectrum another church leader declared that equipping the church was the task of the ordained ministry.

4. How do you understand the relationship between the APEST gifts and the Anglican tradition of deacons, priests and bishops?

This question was acknowledged to be difficult. It appeared this was not something many had reflected on previously even though it is used in ordination liturgies and services of induction for vicars of parishes. One exception, who had a very clear mind on the subject, identified the belief that they are different structures in that the clerical orders form an authority structure within the church while the APEST gifts are ministry gifts that are for everyone, so he saw no conflict. One respondent saw the clerical orders as recognition of a call to leadership in the church while another defined them as servant positions. Two interviewees commented that bishops, priests and deacons expect the church to be their field of ministry, as distinct from the local community. In particular the focus for priests was on sacramental ministry and on a shepherd/teacher role (but sometimes including evangelists) while deacons were community facing, focused on people's needs and justice issues. Most agreed there is not a simple relationship between the two. It was suggested that all APEST gifts are needed among the ordained clergy, and furthermore that whether lay, deacon, priest or bishop we are to function in our gifting in whatever position or role we find ourselves.

Although it was noted that a prophetic church leader could be a challenge, a prophetic bishop was seen as an asset! Five commented that at this time an apostolic bishop would be preferable as that gift would be more likely to be able to bring about the changes needed in the church, and know how to release others, especially other apostles, into their gifts.

5. What do you understand by “to enable the whole mission of the Church”?

This question received diverse responses that often reflected the speaker's gifting.

The focus of shepherd respondents was on serving the needs of the church and community. Two participants with evangelistic gifting mentioned salvation.

Discipleship, training and mentoring was highlighted by a teacher. In contrast some apostles and evangelists saw enabling as training and releasing the people for mission into their communities. The kingdom of God coming into every area of life bringing

transformation to individuals, community and the nation was the focus of another apostle. The care of creation was also mentioned as being a part of the call to mission.

6. To what extent has your training (pre-ordination, post-ordination or other) prepared you to function in each of the five roles?

Apostle: One church leader commented that YWAM¹²³, an apostolic ministry with apostolic leadership, provided training in this area. He went on to express the urgent need to recognise and address the lack of training for both apostolic and prophetic people. One of the apostolic people interviewed understood training for an apostle to be an individual journey that God tailors for each one.

Prophet: Some had experienced prophetic ministry in the form of receiving and giving prophetic words through renewal meetings, but no-one said they had received training to help them understand and live out the role of prophet. One person felt a need to be trained in this area. One of the clergy received her initial Christian training in an apostolic church setting and her experience was the opposite- it was very strong in the prophetic area.

Evangelist: Two interviewees had received two years specialist training in evangelism at the Church Army College of Evangelism and a third had done some training with YWAM. These are both parachurch organisations. Very little training had been received by the others and what was provided was classroom style rather than practical or hands on.

Shepherd: A variety of pastoral training options were mentioned as being helpful. These included CPE¹²⁴ and Cairns supervision training which covers many topics related to pastoral care. Community living experience was identified as an effective way to receive pastoral training by immersion. One mentioned receiving specialist counselling and social work training.

Teacher: All of the church leaders had received good biblical training and felt well prepared to teach others however one ordained minister who had not received any

¹²³ Youth With A Mission.

¹²⁴ Clinical Pastoral Education.

formal theological training did not have the same confidence. No-one commented on their role of training other teachers/preachers.

One noted leadership training, which can operate across all five gift areas, was lacking in the diocesan training until recently. The Caleb course was viewed very positively by those who had benefitted from it. No-one mentioned POMD, post ordination ministry development, as a significant part of their training.

7. To what extent do you exercise the role of apostle, prophet, evangelist, pastor and teacher in your current ministry?

(The APEST gift of the respondent is in brackets)

(AE) “I use the apostolic gift in a regional role. My driving energy is towards restructuring the church particularly in respect to the mission of God and the place of evangelism, and reaching out beyond the church...I am more interested in raising up leaders than...making people feel good...in the pews.”

(APT): “I have been given a role as a pastor-teacher in a local church” but in YWAM my role “was quite apostolic as we were starting new programmes and I had a lot of staff so needed leadership gifts as well.”

(AE) “I lead apostolically in a ST culture by a whole of life approach and I look for people’s gifts. I exercise the role of prophet by listening to God and sharing what I see God is doing and encouraging prayer and the shepherd role by building community.”

(AE) “I am using my apostolic gift by pioneering new ways of being church using the T4T church planting model. I use my evangelist gift by witnessing to people and developing others gifts. I also shepherd others as there are always issues in people’s lives. I am also discipling others so that is the teacher role.”

(TP) As a “part of being a pastor and a teacher, it’s my job to be a prophet, that is to call people back to God...also to be an evangelist to the congregation to bring the good news.”

(AET) “The apostolic gift is used strongly with strategic planning. I have a shepherding role with the pastoral care of teams and evangelist role is used mainly assisting others in evangelism.”

(SAP) “The role of apostle is exercised for me through the Anglican Mission Board... and the role of prophet is tied into that as well because I challenge.”

(PS) “I am trying to...cast a vision, and get people on board to recognise where God is moving and to take us there...I am involved in the community so people know who I am.”

(PS) “The prophetic role is listening to God, seeing the impossible, seeing wrongs righted, dreaming dreams and strategizing...The shepherd role is exercised in caring about people.”

(E) ‘I shepherd people in nurturing a small group... the evangelist gift is used in leading alpha courses.’

(TS) “The teacher gift is used in teaching and lecturing.”

(EP) “I function in a teacher role resourcing children’s ministry. In my leadership of MOSP I function in a prophetic gift- calling gifts out of people... and function apostolically seeding new ministries.”

8. Using Appendix A and Appendix B try to identify which of the five descriptions most fit your interests and passion.

The results from this question were interesting considering the usual dominance of teaching and shepherding gifts in church leadership. After reflecting on what people said, listening for their heart and checking with colleagues, two respondent’s self-identification of gifting was changed to better reflect the strengths, weaknesses and perceived motivations rather than what their present ministry position was requiring them to do.

Apostle: Surprisingly five of the interviewees identified apostolic as their primary gifting. Two were experienced priests who had spent a number of years in parachurch ministry and another was new to ordained ministry. Of the two laity, both were mature people; one had worked all his life in a parachurch ministry while the other was in a specialised ministry role. One other identified apostolic as a secondary gifting.

Prophet: Two thought prophet was their primary gifting and another four thought that might be their secondary gifting.

Evangelist: Of the three who are gifted primarily as evangelists one is a church leader, while the other two are in specialist positions.

Shepherd: Interestingly only one church leader identified as primarily a shepherd gifting but another two had placed shepherd second.

Teacher: There were only two respondents with a primary gift of teacher, one a church leader and one a member of the diocesan ministry team. However two others recognised their secondary gifting as teacher.

Possible APEST gift mix of those interviewed							
Church Leaders	AE	A(PT)	AE	PS	ES ¹²⁵	TP ¹²⁶	S(AP)
Parachurch	AE	EP					
Diocesan Ministry Team	A(TE)	PS	E	TS			

¹²⁵ Changed from SP.

¹²⁶ Changed from PT.

9. Alan Hirsch offers this insight: “Every significant missional movement has in some way incorporated the five functions into its system. When apostles, prophets, evangelists, shepherds and teachers are working together, a wonderful missional ecology is created.”¹²⁷ Can you identify any obstacles to releasing the five APEST gifts in Anglican churches?

Church Cultural Change

The interviews revealed a common thought that the church has been functioning the same way for so long it would be hard to change. Traditions, rigidity of structures, hierarchical models of church and institutional thinking can result in a reluctance to make changes. It was felt that the church often tries harder to fix a problem rather than try a new way which makes it hard to be creative.

Lay and Clerical Divide

Some thought that the voice of laity is not listened to. Several commented that the church needs to think outside the clergy mould where only the voices of bishops, priests and deacons are considered. One respondent observed that lay people who want to express opinions on the status quo of the Anglican Church and stress the Ephesians 4 model are not listened to fully. Opinions appear to be given more credibility when they are offered by an ordained minister.

Practical Issues:

The workload of administration and meetings was acknowledged as taking time away from training and releasing people in ministry. Also mentioned was the time consumed caretaking and maintaining buildings, an issue which has been highlighted by ongoing earthquake related issues.

APEST Issues

While the teacher and shepherd gifts continued to dominate, the gifts of evangelist, apostle and prophet appeared often to have been overlooked and/or not understood.

¹²⁷ Alan Hirsch, Three-Overlooked-Leadership-Roles. fieldusa.org/wp.../Three-Overlooked-Leadership-Roles-Alan-Hirsch2.pdf. Cited online 27 Nov 2014.

One respondent commented that there was a perception that apostles and prophets are not Anglican. Others expressed the view that the church did not want to face the challenge of apostles and was fearful of both apostles and prophets. Another suggested there appeared to be an unwillingness to face our challenges and allow those with apostolic gifts to show us a new structure. A note of frustration appeared where one respondent suggested a lack of understanding and respect between the gifts, for example, “prophets are told they need to be more sympathetic, but I don’t see any return of respect ... the burden of the prophet is to speak the truth clearly, and often without compromise, and what they have got to say needs to be heard.” Another observation was the church was not good at finding space for the evangelists- “we are content to send them to a parachurch body.”

Training Issues

It was generally agreed that the training for APE giftings needs improving with one respondent saying, “Educationally ...we aren’t really equipped or the structures aren’t really there to identify and help train the apostle and prophet. There appears to be a tendency to let evangelists do their own thing and hope they bring more people to the church.” A suggestion from a clergyperson with wide experience was to invite others from outside our diocese/denomination to help train in the areas of APE ministry where we do not have the gifting or experience.

Another comment made was the equipping of ordained ministry is unbalanced due to the missing input from apostles, prophets and evangelists. Not only do we present a disfigured picture of Jesus to the world, but this would have a flow on affect to the parishes. One respondent considered that people in leadership are not good at recognising giftings and developing them in their people although it was commented that the three Anglican mission bodies, CMS¹²⁸, CANZ¹²⁹ and ABM¹³⁰, have more balanced leadership strategies compared to the church.

¹²⁸ Church Missionary Society.

¹²⁹ Church Army in New Zealand.

¹³⁰ Anglican Board of Mission.

One church leader identified that mobility of people was an issue in his church as it took time to train people before they could be released into ministry, and in small churches it can be difficult to find all the gifts.

Discipleship and Leadership Issues

Making disciples should be our first priority with a budget to prove it. A lack of understanding about what these gifts are and how they work together was given as another issue. Connected to this is the need for better team skills and learning how to release others into their gifts.

Several thought fear was an issue, fear in the people and leaders and also “fear of offending the hierarchy.” Several commented on insecurity being an obstacle. One clergyperson commented “Egos...Many people in leadership feel threatened” while another had experienced insecurity in leadership shutting people down.

10. The Anglican Church has traditionally chosen clergy with teaching and pastoral gifting. Can you see how a person (ordained or lay) with apostolic, prophetic or evangelistic gifting could be used within the Anglican Church structure?

The results from the interviews revealed that most respondents believed that the challenge APEs bring to the church needs to be welcomed and embraced with their first task, training up other APE disciples. It is generally agreed that the church needs to be shaped by all 5 gifts working together in partnership, not in competition, but not under ST¹³¹ control.

One interviewee identified that “it is hard for APE types to get opportunities and sometimes they had to wait years for doors to open.” Several agreed that APEs are essential to lead mission and there is a need to release them into their ministries without feeling threatened by them. It was also noted that APEs needed to be released into ministries outside of the church. An observation made was that APEs should be better valued for their life experience and encouraged in their ministry in the world.

¹³¹ Shepherd-teacher.

Apostolic Gifting: It was noted that the apostolic gift was important for leadership today and was especially needed for a bishop. Another agreed adding that with an apostolic bishop there would be growth. Apostolic lay leadership is important too.

Prophetic Gifting: Several respondents commented that the church needs to listen to prophetic people and seek direction from their prophetic input. The value of the prophetic gift for breaking open issues in people's lives so that growth and healing can occur was identified as a major benefit of the gift.

Evangelistic Gifting: A question was raised: if the church released evangelists but did not change itself, what do we bring new people back to? Another saw a possible solution would be to encourage the APEs together to build radical new faith communities suitable for new disciples.

Ordination: Responses noted the challenge for apostles and prophets to get into the system through ordination. The second challenge identified was to be allowed to do things differently, maybe to work as specialists. It was commented that Bishop Justin is seeking out and ordaining a different kind of person in Wellington. A suggestion offered was that all candidates for ordination spend a year apprenticed to a team of APEs in a new faith community. Two questions were asked. Where does ordination fit with leadership? Secondly, can an apostle function without ordination? One person emphasized that the local church is a modality and needs the ST gifts as well as the APEs.

11. The Church of England has adopted the term 'pioneer' instead of 'apostle' thinking it would avoid confusion between apostolic ministry and the authority of bishops. Which term do you prefer?

While most agreed that 'pioneer' was less threatening as the term was not loaded with as many issues, four were very decisive about preferring 'apostle' as it is the biblical word. These four all carry an apostolic gift and three were very experienced ministers having worked in both church and parachurch ministries. The reasons given were simply Jesus called apostles not pioneers and although apostolic people pioneer, apostolic ministry is more than pioneering. Anyone can pioneer but that does not mean they are gifted as an apostle.

12. Alan Hirsch's exegesis of Ephesians 4: 11 proposes that everyone has a calling in at least one of the APEST gifts, not just leaders, but that calling needs to mature to become a ministry. Furthermore he proposes that some people will also have a leadership gift to exercise within that role. For each gift can you identify people, lay or ordained, who seem to fit the profile that Hirsch gives?

The five apostles and two of the evangelists had no difficulty in identifying people, lay and ordained, who fitted each gift description. Several said they could name people who functioned outside of the church in these gifts such as an apostolic businessman. One interviewee commented that they knew many laity who had prophetic and/or apostolic gifting but prophetic clergy are hard to think of. An itinerant minister said he could identify people in New Zealand with gifts of prophet, evangelist, shepherd and teacher but only a few apostles. He could name many apostles from overseas. Another church leader said he could identify skills and talents among his congregation but didn't feel that it necessarily translated to APEST giftings. One interviewee was able to identify some but on reflection added that we are not good at speaking into people's lives and encouraging each other in our gifts.

One church leader offered the insight that the focus of the 90s was on strengthening our weaknesses and now it is on acknowledging and working in our strengths but in teams to complement each other and to cover our areas of weakness.

13. The churches in the Nelson Diocese have been challenged to become missional in focus. The term "missional" is used in different ways.

What is your understanding of the term?

General comments in response to this question included that in the Nelson Diocese "Missional" is used to mean growing churches or looking outwards and bringing people in. One lamented that the "power of the missional movement is being diluted by usage to get it to conform to the systems and structures and language of the existing church rather than being liberated to a work that is taking place outside the walls of the church, by its members, to give life, or to bring the challenge of the gospel, and maybe give life to new forms of faith community." Most respondents agreed that missional is moving beyond the walls of the church, connecting with neighbours and community, meeting their needs and working for social justice. One mentioned the cross-cultural aspect within New Zealand while for another the emphasis lay on it being God's mission in an

outwards direction, working where God is already working but also inwards to deeper discipleship. Two interviewees picked up the importance of equipping necessary to be a “sent people” so that all are able to be ministering to and in the community.

Three spoke of missional being a kingdom concept and another narrowed it to bringing new people into the kingdom. Two clergy were more specific, speaking about Landa Cope’s seven areas of influence:¹³² government, science and technology, media and communication, economic, church, education and family. One who spends much of his time equipping others summed it up, “Missional is not primarily outreach or attracting people. It is equipping every disciple to be an agent of the kingdom. We are a sending church not a reaching out church. We are God’s missional church and this is a massive mindset change.”

14. What do you see are the obstacles to developing a missional culture in our churches?

An observation that one respondent identified is that historically, mission for Anglicans has been equated with supplying finance in the form of the parish mission quota for overseas mission. How the church is structured and organised was seen a hindrance. Old fashioned structures, church form and clothing was offered by another interviewee, along with the suggestion that our language and theology of priesthood alienates people. Several mentioned the pastoral model, with the dominance of the ST gifting, and the time, energy and finance used maintaining buildings, systems and Sunday services as obstacles. Another identified the belief that church is for me/us rather than for others as a hindrance.

On another level two people thought busyness was an issue as personal relationships and connections with others suffer. Added to this was the thought that there is a closed set mentality of who is in or out instead of a centred set way of thinking in which we see people moving towards Jesus in the centre. The outworking of this is a narrow view of evangelism rather than the church community being a safe place for people to journey towards a deeper faith.

¹³² Landa Cope, *An Introduction to the Old Testament Template: Rediscovering God’s Principle for Discipling Nations*, 2nd ed. (Seattle: YWAM, 2011).

Discipleship issues mentioned as obstacles include fear and hardness of heart, a lack of prayer and intentional hearing from God which is essential if we are to follow where God is leading. Also noted was a lack of confidence in the gospel and a weakness in our ability to defend the gospel and added to this, and perhaps because of this, is a lack of willingness to suffer and sacrifice. On the practical side a lack of strategic planning and coordination were identified as weaknesses. A culture change will not happen without a strategy to bring about the changes.

15. It has been said that today's leaders will need new skills especially an ability to relate to a new and changing culture and an ability to work in teams with clergy and lay people. To what extent do you feel you have been trained and to lead and minister in our changing culture and to work in, lead and develop team ministry?

Changing Culture

One leader appreciated being able to draw on the resources of a Presbyterian advisor to help understand the context especially as that denomination seemed to be more in tune with the reality of decreasing numbers in denominational churches in New Zealand.

A comment from a respondent who is in full-time ministry revealed that he felt isolated from the changing culture but family kept him connected to a certain extent. Another respondent said, "We have been trained in a way that continues to cultivate the prevailing culture of the church, and the prevailing focus of the church. To be different requires going outside of the church culture as we've known it, and engaging with people who are thinking outside the square and thinking outside of conventional church... But...the power of the prevailing culture is so strong and so time consuming it's sometimes really difficult to accomplish much shift in the missional journey."

The need for conversations about changing paradigms was identified as being important by one interviewee. An experienced leader working in a parachurch setting where he has received church planting training commented "I have been trained on the job but over the last three to four years I feel I have been retrained to be missional."

Team Ministry

A young church leader commented that ideally every new minister would work in a well functioning team and gain experience from that however, he did not get that opportunity. This was supported by comments from another respondent who observed although it is useful to talk about it, experiencing good team dynamics was the best way to learn. Some, including all five women, felt they were naturally collaborative. Several had substantial secular work experience of functioning in teams acknowledging that their team training was on the job or through avenues outside of the church. Several of the leaders had sought training, for example, conflict management training, and found that very useful in their work with people.

16. What resources or training would you like to see available to assist our church culture to become missional?

The suggestions made by the interviewees for further resourcing and training have been grouped under several headings.

Personal Growth:

At a very foundational level, all disciples, including leaders, need to be healed in their identity as sons and daughters of the Father. Leaders need training to understand their own gifting and opportunities and a willingness to enter into the healing process. We need to understand that church attendance is not the same as being a Jesus follower. The apostolic gift will help us see our blind spots. We need better understanding of world view and adopt a kingdom mindset.

Experience:

Several mentioned the need for experience of mission so it becomes a part of our DNA. “Having engaged across the different denominations has brought a wider perspective and challenged me all my ministry life.” “We need to experience different models of church and team ministry. We need to hear stories from places already doing things differently.”

Current training:

New courses have been made available in the last few years and people are taking up these opportunities.

- The 3DM training was called the best discipleship course experienced so far.
- The Caleb leadership course made available through the diocese has been appreciated by three of those interviewed.
- T4T Church planting training through Church Army was mentioned by two people as being very good as well as providing a different model for being church.

New Training:

There was a keenness to access more training. Ideas suggested included opportunities to be in an apprentice relationship with someone ahead of us in our gift area. It was also acknowledged that APEST training opportunities need to be in our strengths as well as in other areas as required. It was suggested that the church would be turned upside down if the best apostles, prophets, evangelists, shepherds and teachers from around the world be recruited to retrain the Anglican Church in the 5 fold ministries.

A mention was made of good secular training that is available in the seven areas of influence, for example, western business training has Christian principles. It was asked if we could hear more from Rosemary Dewerse and Kevin Ward, both speakers at the 2017 Diocesan Leaders' Conference and also have more practical training e.g. Discerning God's voice and putting it into action?

Resources:

It was suggested we will see a massive change if after the best teachers, shepherds, evangelists, prophets and apostles come and train us, we establish some Anglican apostolic centres, equipping centres where research and development in apostolic ministry is resourced from and specialised ministry training is made available.

The observation was made by another that there is an urgent need to identify the apostolic gifts among us and release them.

There is a lack of suitable material to give to families without a faith background.

There was a need identified for short articles or abstracts to be discussed in intentional conversation around the change process, mission and discipleship.

Other comments:

Some comments made by respondents have been included here to recognise the concerns raised and treat them with the importance warranted. They include:

- The church needs young people and especially young leaders but they need to be trained as disciples first otherwise they will not lead people to Jesus.
- The need to first focus on character when choosing leaders rather than the dynamic personality that our society is drawn to.
- A need to model and teach team culture rather than the CEO model of leadership.
- A need to trust the Shepherd when he leads us to do new and scary things.
- A need for bishops and other leaders within the life of the church to engage with the hard stuff because change will not be popular. Those pioneering new ways need the support and backing of the diocesan and church leaders if they are to survive.

Chapter 6

Analysis and Discussion

This research paper has sought support for Hirsch's statement that the gifts of apostle, prophet, evangelist, shepherd and teacher are needed to transition an institutional model church to one with a missional culture and identify a growing need to adopt his proposal. Chapter 2, the literature review, includes examples of churches which have, with apostolic leadership, embraced the fivefold model of ministry in their congregations and developed a missional culture. The literature also reveals how a similar model has been used successfully in secular environments.

A biblical framework that includes an exegesis of Eph 4:7-13 has been described in Chapter 3, and the conclusion from this is clear, that the five gifts, apostle, prophet, evangelist, shepherd and teacher have not ceased, but these continue to be needed within the body of Christ if we are to grow in, and continue the ministry of Jesus today. In the current chapter there is a discussion of three different attempts to encourage growth in the Anglican Church of New Zealand, by viewing them through the APEST lens. Topics that were introduced and discussed in interviews with ministry leaders are brought into conversation with the literature reviewed and the biblical framework. Finally the strengths of the generative ministry gifts of apostle, prophet and evangelist have been discussed and considered along with identified obstacles to missional growth.

6.1 Three New Zealand Ministry Contexts

6.1.1 The 1990s Growth Period in the Nelson Diocese

Looking back it is possible to see what was not obvious at the time. The church growth principles that bore fruit in the diocese during the 1990s did result in increased congregations for a few years. However, church growth measures of success were more about the worship experience and attracting people to church by attending to comfort and having needs met. The down side of this approach was the reinforcement of a consumer culture in churches. In such a setting the charisma of the evangelist gift creates a welcoming environment that is valuable as it attracts and draws in people. Studies have since shown, that from the mid 1990s, the pool of dechurched people was

decreasing and the church was largely not engaging the unchurched people groups, i.e. those who never had a connection with the church. Mission to the unchurched requires a different approach and must include outreach, evangelism and discipleship which leads to transformed lives. Without realising it, the church was faced with attempting to minister to a culture it was not connecting to or understanding. As one vicar noted, local mission today is cross-cultural and this requires a different style of leadership. Hirsch and Catchim consider apostolic and prophetic leaders to be naturally better suited to cross-cultural environments,¹³³ and they emphasise that it also requires the whole congregation being empowered and equipped to function, each in their own ministry calling.

6.1.2 Team Ministry: Local Shared Ministry in New Zealand

When Local Shared Ministry was introduced it was hoped that by using the gifts of all the people and working as a team, a new missional dynamic would be released. In some places this approach has been sustained but there was, and still is, the problem of finding the next generation to pass the baton on to. This raises the question of what is the difference between the LSM model and the generative APEST model. Although there may be other factors involved, from the information available three issues can be identified.

Firstly, LSM has as its foundation the five Marks of Mission, an important statement on mission which expresses the Anglican Communion's common commitment to, and understanding of, God's holistic/integral mission.¹³⁴ The Five Marks of Mission are:

- To proclaim the Good News of the Kingdom;
- To teach, baptise and nurture new believers;
- To respond to human need by loving service;
- To transform unjust structures of society, to challenge violence of every kind and pursue peace and reconciliation; and
- To strive to safeguard the integrity of creation, and sustain and renew the life of the earth.

This is also shortened to TELL, TEACH, TEND, TRANSFORM and TREASURE.

¹³³ Hirsch and Catchim, *The Permanent Revolution*, 66-67.

¹³⁴ www.anglicancommunion.org/identity/marks-of-mission.aspx (25 July 2017).

Although all are called to participate in all five marks of mission each of us will tend to emphasize one more than the others. Looking through an APEST lens we can broadly identify the gifts that create the environment for each:

TELL- evangelist's heart to proclaim the Good News;

TEACH - teacher and shepherd, with the heart to train and nurture;

TEND – shepherd's heart to nurture;

TRANSFORM – prophet's heart for social justice and shepherd's heart for community;

TREASURE – prophet's calling for issues of sustainability of the earth.

Noticeably absent is the ministry of the apostle who creates a discipling culture that strategizes for the extension of Christianity, and maintains the DNA of the faith, and the vertical dimension of the prophet which guards the covenantal relationship God has with his people,¹³⁵ including a God-centeredness through worship and obedience, while creating a culture of listening to God's voice and prayer.¹³⁶ The apostle and prophet are identified in the APEST model as the two foundational gifts that are essential for creating the environment for a self sustaining movement¹³⁷. Hirsch, who argues that an APEST assessment can be done on whole denominations, concludes that mainline traditions are most likely to emphasize the shepherding and teaching functions with a lesser commitment to the lateral prophetic.¹³⁸ This is consistent with the five marks of mission. To introduce an APEST culture would be to suggest the Anglican Church recognize two aspects of Jesus' ministry, the apostolic and the vertical prophetic, neither of which has been included in its mission statement.

The second issue is mentioned by Haworth who raised the matter of two different priesthoods, the LSM priest and the mobile professional priests. Generally LSM priests may not have had the biblical and theological training normally required of other clergy but they had life experience to draw on and community acceptance. Although ordained equippers were available to support this new style of ministry it takes time to learn how best to equip others. A difference in personality and gifting between the LSM priests and other clergy has been identified. Using Myers-Briggs Temperament Indicator

¹³⁵ Hirsch, *5Q*, 102-103.

¹³⁶ *Ibid.*, 103.

¹³⁷ Hirsch and Catchim, *The Permanent Revolution*, 57-61.

¹³⁸ Hirsch, *5Q*, 103, 141. Hirsch earlier called this the horizontal prophetic which highlights humanity's relationships with others and the world as part of our obligations to God.

(MBTI) tests, studies of clergy in England found LSM clergy were more likely to be conservative than their professional counterparts.¹³⁹ They showed a majority of LSM clergy (and congregations) were SJs or “the guardian” personality compared to other clergy who showed a NF or “the idealist” preference. Hirsch and Catchim maintain that SJs are likely to be at the developer end of the pioneer-developer spectrum i.e. shepherd or teacher while NFs are likely to be towards the middle as evangelist or possibly prophet.¹⁴⁰ If the same pattern is evident in New Zealand and the majority of LSM priests are “guardians” it is not surprising that the LSM model has not had the generative effect that had been hoped for. Team ministry on its own was not sufficient to bring a renewed missional impulse.

Thirdly, Haworth’s report gives no evidence of a discipleship model that taught congregations to hear and obey Jesus’ voice and develop intimacy in their relationship with God. The emphasis was more on fulfilling functions. Hirsch and Catchim contend that the apostolic gift is the one that brings a focus on discipleship in a way that will form new leaders in the process.¹⁴¹ Without a generative leadership culture that comes from the APE functions the model has not been sustainable over the long term.¹⁴²

¹³⁹Leslie J. Francis and Andrew Village, *The psychological temperament of Anglican clergy in ordained local ministry (OLM): the conserving, serving pastor?* Journal of Empirical Theology, 2012, Vol.25 (No.1). pp. 57-76. <<http://dx.doi.org/10.1163/157092512X635743> > (29 Oct 2017).

¹⁴⁰ Hirsch and Catchim, *The Permanent Revolution*, 53.

¹⁴¹ Woodward, *Creating a Missional Culture*, 126.

¹⁴²Ibid.

6.1.3 Missional Culture Change in the Dioceses of Wellington and Nelson

The clergy of the Wellington and Nelson Dioceses are currently facing the same challenge, to lead cultural change and transition their churches from maintenance to missional mode. Blaikie's paper, which focuses on embedding missional culture, suggests Wellington Diocese has recognised the need for training in cultural change issues, and understanding the place and power of culture is essential for all those leading this journey. All organisations including churches have a culture¹⁴³ but it may not be recognised. Woodward explains, "If we hope to create a missional culture we must understand the power of culture in shaping the life of a congregation."¹⁴⁴ This is not a simple task. It takes a leader to create and change culture; a manager will maintain the existing culture.¹⁴⁵

The two dioceses face similar issues. In her paper Blaikie identified a number of obstacles to change that were also mentioned in the current research:

1. Diocesan processes such as evaluations and clergy reviews that still prioritised maintenance goals and values more connected to pastoral care than equipping the congregation to be released into mission.
2. Fear and anxiety in clergy who were trained to be shepherd-teachers and who are now being asked to be something different, something they have not been able to experience or envision. Blaikie estimated 70% of the clergy were lost in the change process.¹⁴⁶ Breen has estimated 70% of the population are shepherds and teachers.¹⁴⁷
3. Congregation members who have become comfortable with the stability and security of the known pastoral model and are reluctant to change.
4. Lack of training in culture change management and accountability for both clergy and congregations.
5. Busyness including keeping Sunday church running, as well as the additional stress for those parishes working on earthquake strengthening of buildings.

These issues will be revisited along with other identified obstacles later in this chapter.

¹⁴³ Ibid., 61.

¹⁴⁴ Woodward, *Creating a Missional Culture*, 33.

¹⁴⁵ Ibid., 61.

¹⁴⁶ Blaikie, 36.

¹⁴⁷ Breen, *The Apostle's Notebook*, (Eastbourne: Kingsway Communications, 2002),

6.2 Understanding of the APEST gifts.

While all of those interviewed had a basic understanding of the ministry focus of apostles, prophets, evangelists, shepherds and teachers and what each person might do, there is a breadth and depth of understanding still to be accessed around the environment that each gift creates and the importance of each gift for equipping others. There was also some confusion between being and doing; the difference between who a person is and what they might do. A person's heart motivation and ease in a ministry area is a better indicator of a gift than a role they function in. For example, an apostle might be described as someone who starts new projects. The assumption is then sometimes made that starting a new project is being an apostle. However every one of the five gifts can initiate a new project, but apostles are energised by doing so and may find themselves pioneering again and again.

6.2.1 APEST Gifts as Equippers

The five APEST ministries are five different aspects of Jesus' ministry. Together the body of Christ is called to continue Jesus' ministry in the world. In the exegesis of Eph 4:7-13 it is stated that these gifts are given to all. Others have different views and would see them restricted to leadership or leadership plus some others. However, Breen believed these gifts were given to everyone and went on to disciple thousands of young people, producing many who became missional leaders. To what extent was his success tied to his belief in the young people being gifted? Roland Allen comments "Christians are not only what they are by nature; they are a Spirit-bearing body. It is not a question of our faith in them: it is still more a question of faith in the Holy Ghost. We look too much at our converts by nature: St Paul looked at his converts as they were by grace."¹⁴⁸ The LifeShapes¹⁴⁹ system Breen developed as a visual reminder for his discipleship teaching was simple and reproducible so that it could be passed on over coffee. Perhaps there is a message here. How much do we trust God to speak to his people? To hear what Jesus is saying and to respond in obedience is the core of 3DM discipleship. The church's fruitfulness may be restricted by limitations put on people.

¹⁴⁸ Roland Allen, *St Paul's Methods or Ours*, 125.

¹⁴⁹ Mike Breen and Walt Kallestad, *A Passionate Life* (Eastbourne: Kingsway Communications, 2005.)

6.2.2 APEST Gifts as Environment Creators

Woodward calls the gifts culture shapers. Each mature gift creates a different environment around them. Together all five gifts create “a thriving, liberating, welcoming, healing and learning environment in the congregation.”¹⁵⁰

A teacher will not only preach and teach scripture but create an environment of life-long learning that encourages the participation of others. A teacher will also produce resources to encourage others to cultivate a love for the scriptures and develop a biblical worldview in the congregation for them to live by.¹⁵¹

A shepherd will not only care for and encourage the congregation but will also create a loving, welcoming community, one in which healing, wholeness and reconciliation is the goal. A shepherd seeks to cultivate the church as the family of God, embracing all people, and by its life, witness to the power of the gospel.¹⁵²

An evangelist is not only one who is comfortable sharing the gospel but one who creates an environment around them that invites people to come and experience life with God. The evangelist will not only preach the gospel and elicit a response but will demonstrate it in word, sign and deed.¹⁵³

A prophet guards the covenant relationship with God and also creates an environment of God-centeredness through worship, prayer and obedience to God. There is a second dimension of guarding the covenant which involves obligations towards others and the world, highlighting, repentance, holiness, justice and speaking out truth.¹⁵⁴

The apostle ensures the church is centred on extending the kingdom and creates an environment that mobilises all the church in discipleship and mission. An apostle has a big picture vision and maintains the health and structure of the organisation.¹⁵⁵

¹⁵⁰ Woodward, *Creating a Missional Culture*, 184.

¹⁵¹ Hirsch, *5Q*, 111-112.

¹⁵² Ibid., 108-111.

¹⁵³ Ibid., 106-108.

¹⁵⁴ Ibid., 102-106.

¹⁵⁵ Ibid., 99-102.

6.2.3 Multiplying APEST Gifts for Missional Leadership

A missional church needs missional leadership. Breen makes the point that leaders naturally multiply who they are. As a local example, Derek Eaton, the previous bishop of Nelson is a gifted bible teacher who greatly values the scriptures and wanted others to as well. In 2008 his vision to restart Bishopdale Theological College in Nelson became a reality. The accessibility, resources and honour given to theological study has created an environment that is encouraging and enabling many others to study. People with the ability to teach at this level are being multiplied as past students now tutor classes. What might a base designed to multiply apostolic, prophetic or evangelistic ministry look like?

A place is needed where the pioneering gifts can flourish and be honoured. An interviewee who understood his apostolic gift suggested a need to invite experienced leaders to offer training in areas that were lacking at present. Hirsch believes the missional leaders needed by the church can only be formed by prioritising discipleship. He insists “The quality of the church’s leadership is directly proportional to the quality of discipleship.”¹⁵⁶ He follows Jesus’ method and only invites active missional practitioners to teach pioneers.¹⁵⁷ Jesus called his disciples and “took them on an adventurous journey of mission, ministry, and learning. Straight away they were involved in proclaiming the kingdom of God, serving the poor, healing, and casting out demons.”¹⁵⁸

6.2.4 APEST Gifts: Digging Deeper

This section expands on the understandings of the APEST gifts to enable reflection of the obstacles identified in the next section. The apostle and prophet were the two gifts that interviewees had the most difficulty recognising in people and consequently, these were the two gifts they found most difficult to appreciate and how they could be used in an Anglican system.

Apostle:

An apostle has been understood as an initiator of new work, a big picture person, a strategist, an extender of the kingdom, one who is sent and a person of the word and

¹⁵⁶ Hirsch, *The Forgotten Ways*, 127.

¹⁵⁷ Ibid., 133.

¹⁵⁸ Ibid., 128.

prayer. The apostolic call is much more. It is a call that focuses the whole church on its calling to be the sent instrument of the mission of God. Core to an apostolic call is to help people live out their calling and discipleship. The apostle creates a releasing culture in which disciples are expected to multiply and make more disciples. An apostolic culture will encourage the whole congregation, every one of the five APEST callings to be released into ministry. “To exclude apostolic influences from any position (as the church has typically done up to this point) is to effectively lock out the distinctly missional leadership that churches so desperately need to recover.”¹⁵⁹

Prophet: Several of the interviewees had difficulty identifying prophets. Spiritual gifts teaching often confuses the Eph 4 prophet and the spiritual gift of prophecy in 1 Cor 12.¹⁶⁰ As a consequence the calling of a prophet has often been reduced to giving people prophetic words. It is true that a prophet has an ear directed to God but it is more than hearing and seeing what God is saying. The prophet is concerned with covenantal faithfulness to God, other people and the world. They are concerned with being obedient to the leading of the Spirit and share God’s heart for those who are hurting. The lack of understanding of this gift can impact on prophets’ sense of value and acceptance by the church. A friend who had retired from a life time of ministry in social justice said he always felt a misfit in the church. The prophetic call has always been difficult but recognising and naming that call as given by Christ brought him validation and peace. One interviewee confessed that we don’t know what a prophet looks like so we do not recognise them. Although Bishop Justin has visited the diocese several times no-one interviewed identified him as a prophet. Other areas of service where prophets can excel are prayer ministries, worship leading, social justice and creative ministries.

Evangelist: The evangelist was well understood in terms of presenting the gospel. What is not so well recognised is the discomfort they sometimes feel in the church setting. They enjoy being with people outside of the church but need to be connected so that the whole body can invite the new disciples into a community of faith.

¹⁵⁹ Hirsch and Catchim, *The Permanent Revolution*, 116.

¹⁶⁰ See the end of chapter 3 of this paper for an explanation of the three main gift passages in scripture.

Shepherd: The shepherd was well understood, except as one interviewee said, “it is not a status quo gift.” It involves the challenge to grow and move beyond the present, to handle conflict and make peace. The shepherd heart is designed for more than welcome and practical care. This gift is designed to be a safe place for ministering healing and wholeness to the brokenness in people’s lives. Shepherd is the most common gift, but that is an indication of the need for this ministry, not a statement of lesser importance.

Teacher: Generally the teacher is one people are familiar with although it not the same as a school teacher. Any of the gifts can teach if they have good communication skills but they will teach differently and will likely have a focus compatible with their base gift. Also a teacher may be utilised as a writer, researcher or librarian rather than an upfront speaker.

The whole is more than the parts.

The teacher and shepherds have no need to fear loss by giving place to the other gifts. Each gift is enhanced by the other four. For example, consider the teacher. An evangelist will bring more disciples for the teacher to teach, the prophet will bring revelation to the teaching role making it more exciting, a shepherd will provide a welcoming environment and the apostle will draw the teacher out into a bigger kingdom vision. In return, the teacher will add to each of the other ministries.

6.2.5 The relationship between the ordained ministry and APEST ministry

Every time the words from Eph 4:11-12 are heard in the context of an Anglican ordination liturgy the common understanding that these gifts are for clergy only, is reinforced. This is where Anglican tradition and scripture meet head on. While they are different structures, the ordained orders are the authority structure of the church while the APEST gifts are for ministry, there is an overlap. Although in theory there should be no conflict, in practice, ministry gifts are a consideration when making decisions involving future ordinands and leadership appointments. The hierarchical nature of the three orders is a problem. While a preference was voiced for apostolic and prophetic gifts in a bishop, these were not mentioned as desirable for priests or parish leaders; the traditional shepherd and possibly teacher giftings were thought to be a better fit. However, bishops are appointed from the pool of priests. There is more freedom to trial

a new style of ministry with permanent or vocational deacons. Diocesan staff raised the notion of deacons having community facing ministry or maybe an evangelistic gifting, although no-one questioned why ordination was needed for community facing ministry. Might ordaining more deacons put another barrier between the congregations and their call to ministry in their community?

Although it is beyond the scope of the current research some questions need to be asked:

- Is redefining the diaconate about strengthening the professional structure of the church, when the focus should be on trusting and releasing all the saints into their missional calling?
- Alternatively is a ministry licence more appropriate than ordination?
- Is ordination to the diaconate what *diakonia* in scripture is about?

For an APEST ministry to function all the gifts need to relate with an equal voice. Some respondents insisted all five gifts are needed in the ordained ministry. To have an equal voice they would need to be ordained as priests. Croft's idea of *episcopate*, *presbyteral* and *diakonia* ministry being shared across the three orders instead of being focussed on one may be a way to enlarge the vision and increase the leadership expectation of ordained ministry. Each parish needs leadership that sees the bigger picture and is able to lead, strategize and empower the congregation. If in the transition there are insufficient clergy gifted in this way perhaps this leadership will need to be shared across a region until others are raised up.

Breen is quite clear, "Leaders define the culture" and "You reproduce who you are."¹⁶¹ A missional church needs missional leaders. Leaders attract those with like gifts and unless there is a strategy to develop people in all five ministry areas it is more likely they will be shaped to be like their leaders rather than who they have been made to be.¹⁶² In the past new leaders have been formed by teachers in theological colleges and shepherds and teachers in parishes. In the Nelson Diocese, the training offered to new clergy is the same for everyone, although the shape of each person's ministry and experience differs greatly. The focus is still on skills for leading services and pastoral care rather than missional leadership. An interviewee identified a problem; there is no way for the system to recognise APEs nor is there a training pathway for them so it is

¹⁶¹ Mike Breen, *Multiplying Missional Leaders* (Pawleys Island: 3DM, 2012), 98.

¹⁶² Ibid.

difficult for them to get into the ordination process. There is no place for pioneer voices to input into training or decision making so teachers and shepherds continue to have the dominant voice. When apostolic people are freed to bring influence, change will happen because that is how they are wired.¹⁶³ The difficulty is the depth of the existing culture. Organisational theory recognises that “any new patterns of behaviour in the system are experienced as opposition to the deeper, more dominant force of equilibrium.”¹⁶⁴

6.2.6 Identifying your APEST calling.

Some of the interviewees found identifying their APEST gift was difficult, noting it had changed over time. For clergy the pressure to conform to the shepherd-teacher model could obscure the true gift area. Breen identified with this issue saying his most fruitful ministry was after he came to terms with his apostolic gift and understood it. He also talks of base ministry, a primary gift area and phase ministry, a temporary ministry focus, which together brings maturity¹⁶⁵. The weaknesses that Hirsch and Catchim identify for each gift often brought new insight.¹⁶⁶ The perceptions of colleagues also helped. An observation made from the interviews was that those who had their identity and giftedness affirmed had a clearer focus and a freedom. The prophetic gift was seen as particularly valuable in this regard.

¹⁶³ Appendix A.

¹⁶⁴ Jeffrey Goldstein, *The Unshackled Organisation* (New York: The Productivity Press, 1994), 14. Quoted in Hirsch, 5Q, 186.

¹⁶⁵ Breen, *Building a Discipling Culture*, 122-129.

¹⁶⁶ Appendix A.

6.3 Obstacles to Creating a Missional Culture

Perceived obstacles raised by interviewees are viewed and discussed through an APEST lens to identify whether or not one of the APE gifts might be helpful in overcoming the obstacle. Appendices A and B have been used for descriptions of the gifts.

Lack of understanding of what the church's mission is.

The Anglican system of a parish mission quota, for supporting overseas missions, was mentioned as a disadvantage because the focus of mission was primarily focused on fundraising and mission to the local community was often overlooked. If the church is not serving the local community it has forgotten its purpose. To be the church is to be missional. The church needs the apostolic voice to call it out to be “a sent people” to the community, to awaken the dreams that are planted in the hearts of the saints and to call out the gifts given to each member of the body of Christ. When the focus turns inwards it is a sign the outward thrust that follows apostolic people is missing. The apostolic voice will also broaden the gospel of salvation to the gospel of the kingdom and work for restoration and transformation in all areas of life.

Lack of confidence in the gospel

A lack of confidence in the gospel was raised by several leaders. When the church sees and experiences the power of the gospel bringing transformation in people's lives confidence grows. The church needs to hear the testimonies of God at work from the evangelists who live on the edge. One interviewee illustrated this by asking, “If you touch a leper, do you expect to get sick or do you expect the leper to get healed?”

Lack of hearing God's voice

It is the prophetic voice that challenges the church to be looking and listening to the voice of God and to obey. The church is in a time of major transition moving out of what was familiar into an unknown place. It is all the more important to be listening for the Spirit's leading.

Pastoral leadership model

The pastoral leadership model has become the expected way for the church to function but it is unbalanced. The expectation that ministry is done by the clergy is not biblical.

Ephesians 4 gives ministry responsibility to all the church. Absalom estimates 50% of a congregation are shepherds and around 20% are teachers.¹⁶⁷ Dowsett identifies shepherd teacher (ST) as ‘nurturer’ and teacher shepherd (TS) as ‘trainer’. By far these are the two largest groups. When the majority of a congregation have these profiles and often the leadership too it is not surprising that the church remains in a state of dependence without the balance provided by APE types. In effect an unhealthy parent-child relationship can develop. While the shepherd and teacher are wired to nurture and train in a safe environment, the apostolic and prophetic call is in the opposite direction, to send out to risk and adventure. Both are needed in tension.

Workload pressures on clergy

Maintaining a healthy work-rest balance is one of first discipleship themes in 3DM. The time, energy and resources that Sunday and buildings consume are an ongoing issue. Breen likens these to a horse trying to pull a cart that is too heavy. The horse is the missional leader; the cart is the mission vehicle. His suggested solution is to feed the horse while slowly making the cart more lightweight and low maintenance.¹⁶⁸ Recognise what is growing and put resources into that and whenever something new is started, something else needs to stop. Trying to keep doing what worked years ago with fewer resources will lead to clergy burn out.

Training for culture change

The current research has identified what appears to be a large omission in the training offered to clergy and lay leaders within the church. Culture change is complex. Understanding the changing culture of the day and strategising to work to change a church culture are both tasks suited to the apostolic gift. With the shepherd teacher leadership so dominant in the Anglican Church four leaders commented that apostolic and prophetic are not seen as Anglican. Among those interviewed for in the current research none of the leaders had received training in leading culture change or in understanding the power of culture in people’s lives, although several of the apostolic leaders had taken the initiative for themselves and found help in other settings. Woodward speaks of Jesus as the archetypical culture creator and the five APEST ministries as culture shapers, giving them the nicknames of:

¹⁶⁷ In conversation.

¹⁶⁸ Breen, *Multiplying Missional Leaders*, 122.

dream awakener, heart revealer, story teller, soul healer and light giver.¹⁶⁹ Each contributes to the culture of the church community in a different way however, it is the apostle who calls people to discipleship and active participation in God's mission.¹⁷⁰ "The apostolic gifting carries with it an ability to create culture."¹⁷¹ Not understanding this and failing to identify and release both clergy and lay leaders with apostolic gifts for this purpose seriously handicaps the diocese in achieving its goal of transitioning to missional churches and fulfilling the church's reason for being. Hirsch comments, "Over time all organizations tend to become more important than their founding mission. When this happens they will actively enforce conformity, codify behaviour, actively weed out dissent. In other words they tend to equilibrium and resist disequilibrium."¹⁷² Change agents who are gifted to envision an alternative way are ostracised. Unless there is deliberate managed change a system will work to return to its previous state of comfort.

The fear and anxiety generated by change and moving into unknown territory could be difficult for shepherds to handle as their preference is for stability. The fear could be minimised by telling stories or painting a picture of what could be. APEST gifts need to be taught widely to congregations and clergy so that people become able to recognise their own calling and understand how all ministry areas complement each other. When each person understands how they have been uniquely wired for ministry and have a valued role in the wider story they are likely to be released in a new way to make their contribution to the mission of the church.

Engaging congregations

Engaging laity on the missional journey will be a test of leadership skill. Blaikie's paper mentioned the possibility of a covenant for laity that would raise the bar of Christian practice and discipleship.¹⁷³ However, Jesus functioned relationally. He had the ability to invite people into relationship and challenge them in such a way that they stayed with him.¹⁷⁴

¹⁶⁹ Woodward, *Creating a Missional Culture*, 121.

¹⁷⁰ Ibid.

¹⁷¹ Ibid, 126.

¹⁷² Hirsch, 5Q, 188.

¹⁷³ Blaikie, 67.

¹⁷⁴ Breen, *Building a Discipling Culture*, 16.

Lack of Discipleship

There is a need for discipleship that relates to where people are at in their journey. An evangelist noted that for some in our congregations that may mean conversion.

Generally Anglican congregations have not been challenged to mature in spiritual practices. The vehicle for discipleship must change with the culture around us.

Woodward notes the changes over the years from the print age to the broadcast age and now to the digital age.¹⁷⁵ Classrooms and seminars have given way to homes and the streets. Formality has given way to relational and interactive methods.¹⁷⁶ The need to belong, to be connected to a community is strong in the midst of family and relationship breakdowns.¹⁷⁷ The 3DM discipleship model is relational and caters for strong community.

Historical structures, systems and culture

Historically Anglicanism sought uniformity in worship and to reproduce common practice as it spread around the globe. The Christendom mindset also valued common belonging, common beliefs and common behaviour. It may be that this desire for uniformity has now become so deeply embedded in Anglicanism that to recognise a difference in gifting and preferences, challenges identity, worth and maybe, power.

¹⁷⁵ Woodward, *Creating a Missional Culture*, 68.

¹⁷⁶ Ibid.

¹⁷⁷ Breen, *The Apostle's Notebook*, 35.

6.4 Obstacles to implementing an APEST Culture

Insecurity issues in leadership

Several leaders raised issues of ego, insecurity, fears and anxiety as obstacles especially when it stops the congregation being released. Issues of identity and gifting are discipleship issues that are addressed in 3DM. The church should be a safe healing environment where everyone is seeking healing. Personal growth and transformation is seen as a ministry for shepherds but it does require the ability to challenge others to grow. Breen commented that when he understood and accepted his apostolic gifting his ministry began to flourish. Especially for the APEs, knowing and understanding why they view things differently is freeing. The challenge of the apostolic and prophetic voice may be difficult for some shepherds to handle.

.

Lack of understanding of how to identify, train and use the APEST gifts

If the church does not understand how the gifts function together and the benefit each gift brings there will be no priority given to identifying and training the APEs. Unless leaders have had secular work experience it is not likely they have experienced good team dynamics. An APEST culture requires team work. Two interviewees suggested the Anglican Church would benefit from input from others to help with this training and one suggested an apostolic centre where apprenticeship style training was offered.

Many of the perceived obstacles to creating a missional culture were issues that the apostolic and prophetic gifts especially would have much to offer the church. However those gifted in this way also need to be trained to fully release their potential and deserve the best trainers that can be found.

Chapter 7

Conclusion

When the Diocese of Nelson recognised that a change in paradigm was needed if the church was to communicate the gospel to the wider community, and especially to the younger generation, this was a challenge to question the existing institutional culture and seize the opportunity to move towards a missional model. Rather than despair over the decline in church attendance and the aging congregations it became an opportunity to reflect and try new things, a time to check foundations, cultural assumptions, listen to the Spirit's voice and do some realignment. In this context the current research faces up to the challenge to re-evaluate our understanding of Eph 4:7-13 and what it means for the church to be called to participate in the mission of God.

The parish clergy are the front line and they work hard, often with diminishing resources and increased expectations from denominational leadership on one side and congregations on the other, while often feeling that their training has not equipped them for the task or the changed environment in which they are ministering. Yet in the midst of this pressure Jesus calls us to rest in him for he promised that he will build his church. It is time to revisit the basics. Two questions lie deep in the hearts of humanity: Who am I? What am I here for? These two questions also lie at the heart of discipleship. Each one of us, like Jesus, needs to hear the Father's voice; you are my loved son or daughter with whom I am well pleased. (cf Luke 3:22) As believers, we all need to know that we are called and gifted to serve. There is a place in the mission of God for each one of us.

The current research began with a focus on the APEST¹⁷⁸ ministry gifts, and especially the APE gifts that have been largely overlooked in the Anglican Church. The current research has identified four interconnected areas that need to be addressed: cultural change and the change process, discipleship, training in APEST ministries and releasing the pioneers into ministry.

¹⁷⁸ APEST is an acronym for apostle, prophet, evangelist, shepherd and teacher. There is a fuller explanation on page 39.

Culture Change

A new culture is needed, a culture that empowers the whole church. It is the leaders that create a culture and the language used reveals the deeper beliefs that are often hidden. Changing a culture, especially for a mature system like the Anglican Church, is a complex task that takes time and training. Understanding the existing culture and unspoken beliefs of a church is the first step towards learning to create a new empowering culture that a missional church requires. Keys to changing the culture of our churches is found in Eph 4 in which the gifts are the five dimensions of Jesus' ministry that all believers are called to play their part. When it is understood that the apostolic gift is the one wired to catalyse change it is clear they need to be identified and used. While some apostles are gifted to found new work, others are gifted in re-founding existing structures which will empower those working on the regions. It will take courage to release control to the regions and allow things to be done differently, to bring down the barrier between clergy and laity and actively listen to the voices of those on the edge.

Jesus perfectly modelled the five dimensions of ministry. He called people to follow him, he disciplined them and shared his life with them. His disciples witnessed him in prayer, watching what the Father was doing. Having had mission modelled, the disciples were then sent out to do the same. The pattern of being sent, discerning and then acting illustrates the primary role of the apostolic and prophetic dimensions of ministry and mission. To reactivate the mission of the church the apostolic and prophetic dimensions of ministry need to be recovered working in partnership with the other gifts.

Discipleship

Discipleship is a key to a missional culture and another concern for apostolic ministry. During the process of the current research the Diocese of Nelson has encouraged a team to take advantage of 3DM¹⁷⁹ training that has recently been made available in New Zealand. This is an exciting development as the process trains disciples to become missional leaders, who will in turn train and release more disciples. Included in this process is identifying each person's APEST ministry dimension and learning to

¹⁷⁹ 3DM stands for 3D Movements, a global movement with the goal of putting mission and leadership back into the hands of everyday people. It grew out of Mike Breen's ministry in Sheffield, UK.

understand how these gifts fit together with others in the body of Christ. There is a risk that this 3DM training might be treated as a programme offering head knowledge rather than an opportunity for life transforming mentoring, so if it is to be successful it is important that those in decision making roles have a full understanding, and preferably experience, of the 3DM process and its application in the community.

Youth and Young Adults

The most urgent place to establish a new discipleship culture is with youth and young adults. Not only are they at a stage of making important decisions for their lives but their enthusiasm, desire to belong and be active in making a difference in the world needs to be harnessed. Youth ministry must have at its centre a discipleship ethos. 3DM provides a learning and accountability model designed for young people so it can be passed on. Focussing on growing young leaders is not sufficient. Only if they are first disciples will they lead their peers to Jesus. To be a leader in mission is to be counter cultural and that requires them first be formed in Christ and transformed in their lifestyle.

Training Bases

A missional culture is a thriving, liberating, welcoming, healing and learning environment. A training base is needed for each dimension. Already the diocese has a learning hub for theological and biblical study in Bishopdale Theological College. There is a need for specialised training for each of the other dimensions to be provided and led by experienced practitioners in each area. The hub may consist of people able to train and encourage others and work out of existing facilities or homes. For example, a mission hub could be a base where outreach skills would be taught and from which outreach is led. A healing centre could provide prayer for healing including inner healing by people trained in that ministry. A school of the Spirit could provide training in the prophetic dimension and prayer, including hearing God's voice and living in the Spirit. If there is any lack of expertise in these areas within the Anglican Church there may, initially, be a need to ask leaders from other churches to help with the training. Because of the smaller proportion of apostolic, prophetic and evangelistic gifts it would be advantageous to have safe places for these people, both clergy and laity, to sharpen their skills and gain confidence in their callings.

Managing the Workload of Change

The temptation is to keep adding good things to the overloaded cart which the horse is already struggling to pull. For the new is to flourish it is important for space to be made. That means identifying what could be stopped while the new training takes place.

Pioneer Gifts

All five gifts including the pioneer gifts, APE, can and should be used in the Anglican Church and to achieve this, recognition needs to be given to pioneers by encouraging them to identify and release the dream that the Spirit is birthing in them and by having a place for pioneers to gather. The APEs will lead differently but the church would be wise to be open to the blessing that this will bring. Each gift will be enriched through working alongside the others and new energy will be released. While there is value in having a plan, we remain mindful that it is Jesus who is building his church. It is time to look and see what the Spirit is bubbling up among his people; it may not be in the centre but around the edges. In Marlborough, where this study has been focussed, there is an apostolic presence within the leadership of the region. This is a mentoring ministry which has input into most of the parishes at some level. Fresh shoots are already appearing. There are signs indicating that each of these five ministry areas may find a natural base in the region.

The challenge for the diocese will be giving the new life freedom to grow. The missional model is one that is decentralised with power released to those working on the edge. New life begins small, barely noticeable, but it will grow and multiply as people are disciplined, empowered and released. There is a need to resist the temptation to continue the attractional church model which pulls control back to the centre. This could lead to missional leaders being disempowered and their vision for new life being cut off.

The current research supports Hirsch's statement that the more generative gifts of apostle, prophet and evangelist are necessary to activate a paradigm shift and the revitalization of the church and its mission. Ideally apostolic leadership operating in each of the regions could be a catalyst to start the process of change. The Nelson Diocese now has an opportunity to move towards an exciting movement of growth by taking Hirsch's proposal seriously, uncovering these gifts among leaders and

congregations, providing training, encouragement, and releasing them to minister, using their gifts in the mission of God.

Bibliography

- Allen, Roland. *Missionary Methods: St Paul's or Ours?* Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1924, 1962.
- Arnold, Clinton E. *Ephesians*. ECNT. Grand Rapids: Zondervan, 2010.
- Baker, Jonny. "The Pioneer Gift" in *The Pioneer Gift: Explorations in Mission*, Jonny Baker and Cathy Ross (ed) London: Canterbury Press, 2014.
- Blaikie, Susan. "Equipping Missional Leaders to Embed Missional Culture in the Anglican Diocese of Wellington." MMin diss. University of Otago, 2013.
- Bell, Judith, *Doing your Research Project*, 5th ed. Open University Press, Maidenhead, 2010, 12.
- Breen, Mike, *The Apostle's Notebook*. Eastbourne: Kingsway Communications, 2002.
- Breen, Mike and the 3DM team, *Building a Discipling Culture: How to Release a Missional Movement by Discipling People like Jesus did*. Pawleys Island, SC: 3DM Publishing, 2011.
- Breen, Mike and the 3DM team, *Multipling Missional Leaders: From half-hearted volunteers to a mobilized Kingdom force*. Pawleys Island, SC: 3DM Publishing, 2012.
- Breen, Mike and Walt Kallestad, *A Passionate Life*. Colorado Springs, CO: Nexgen (Cook Communications Ministries), 2005.
- Cole, Neil. *Primal Fire: Reigniting the Church with the Five Gifts of Jesus*. Carol Stream, IL: Tyndale Momentum, 2014.
- Cope, Landa. *An Introduction to the Old Testament Template*, 2nd ed. Seattle, Washington: YWAM Publishing, 2011.
- Croft, Steven. *Ministry in Three Dimensions: Ordination and leadership in the Local Church*. London: Darton, Longman & Todd, 2008.
- Frost, Michael and Alan Hirsch. *The Shaping of Things to Come: Innovation and Mission for the 21st Century Church*. Peabody: Hendrickson, 2003.
- Hirsch, Alan, *5Q: Reactivating the Original Intelligence and Capacity of the Body of Christ*. Unspecified: 100M, 2017.
- Hirsch, Alan. *The Forgotten Ways, revised*. Grand Rapids: Brazos, 2016.

- Hirsch, Alan, Tim Catchim and Mike Breen. *The Permanent Revolution: Apostolic Imagination and Practice for the 21st Century Church*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 2012.
- Howarth, Geoffrey. "The Triumph of Maintenance over Mission or Local Mission at the Flaxroots? Change and Development in Local Shared Ministry in Tikanga Pakeha in the Anglican Church of Aotearoa, New Zealand and Polynesia". A study leave report. Diocese of Christchurch, 2009.
- Kew, Richard and Roger White. *Towards 2015: A Church Odyssey*. Cambridge, Mass, 1997.
- Kingston, Robin. "The Derek Eaton Years 1990-2006" in *Harvest of Grace*, Nelson: Anglican Diocese of Nelson. 2010.
- O'Brien, Peter T. *The Letter to the Ephesians*. PNTC. ed. D.A. Carson. Nottingham: Apollos, 1999.
- Roxburgh, Alan J. and Fred Romanuk. *The Missional Leader: Equipping Your Church to Reach a Changing World*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 2006.
- Scott, Benjamin G. McNair. Making sense of contemporary Charismatic Apostolates. PhD thesis King's College, London. 2012.
- Stott, John R.W. *The Message of Ephesians*. BST. Downers Grove: IVP, 1979.
- The Anglican Church in Aotearoa, New Zealand and Polynesia. *A New Zealand Prayer Book/ He Karakia Mihinare o Aotearoa*. Christchurch: Genesis Publications, 2002.
- Thielman, Frank. *Ephesians*. BENTC. Robert W. Yarbrough and Robert M. Stein ed. Grand Rapids: Baker, 2010.
- Woodward, J.R. *Creating a Missional Culture: Equipping the Church for the Sake of the World*. Downers Grove: Inter-Varsity Press, 2012.
- Wright, Christopher J.H. *The Mission of God's People: a Biblical Theology of the Church's Mission*. Grand Rapids: Zondervan, 2010.
- Wright, Tom. *Paul for Everyone: The Prison Letters: Ephesians, Philippians, Colossians and Philemon*, 2nd ed. London: SPCK, 2004.

Online resources:

Anglican Communion. <www.anglicancommunion.org/identity/marks-of-mission> (25 July 2017).

Anglican Diocese of Nelson.

<www.bishopdale.ac.nz> (7 May 2017).

<www.nelsonanglican.org.nz/mosp> (7 May 2017).

<www.nelsonanglican.org.nz/ministry-resources> (7 May 2017).

Church Army in New Zealand. <www.ca-nz.org> (7 May 2017).

Dowsett, Andrew. "Jesus given: Living the life you were called to be."

<www.academia.edu/2339081/Jesus-given_living_the_life_you_were_called-to_be> (21 July 2016).

<www.academia.edu/2343479/Jesus-given_part_2_apostles> (21 July 2016).

<www.academia.edu/2350304/Jesus-given_part_3_prophets> (21 July 2016).

<www.academia.edu/2496630/Jesus-given_part_4_evangelists> (21 July 2016).

<www.academia.edu/5094623/Jesus-given_part_5_shepherds> (21 July 2016).

<www.academia.edu/5094630/Jesus-given_part_6_teachers> (21 July 2016).

Francis, Leslie J. and Village, Andrew. (2012) *The psychological temperament of Anglican clergy in ordained local ministry (OLM): the conserving, serving pastor?* Journal of Empirical Theology, Vol.25 (No.1). pp. 57-76.

<<http://dx.doi.org/10.1163/157092512X635743>> (29 Oct 2017).

Hirsch, Alan. "Three Overlooked Leadership Roles," *Christianity Today*, Spring, 2008.

<www.christianitytoday.com/pastors/2008/spring/7.32.html> (15 Nov 2017)

Ward, Kevin. "Christendom, Clericalism, Church and Context."

<www.presbyterian.org.nz/about-us/research-resources/research-papers/christendom-clericalism-church-and-context> (31 August 2017)

APPENDIX A - APEST Summary - Hirsch and Catchim

	Apostle	Prophet	Evangelist	Shepherd	Teacher
Core vocation	Custodian of DNA Pioneer Entrepreneur Architect	Guardian of the Covenant Questioner of the status quo	Connector to cause Recruiter Entrepreneur Raconteur '	Nurturer Humanizer Sustainer Social integrator	Mediator of wisdom and understanding Trainer-educator Theological formation
Impulse	Missional	Incarnational	Attractional	Communal	Instructional
Effect	Propagate	Incarnate	Aggregate	Integrate	Explicate
Focus	A viable future and expansion of the Christian movement	God orientation: Keeping the movement aligned with God	That people come to know God and join the movement	The community living healthily in the love of the triune God	Awareness and integration of truth, especially revealed truth
Spirituality-character complex	Adventurous and futuristic Has an architectural/systemic sensibility, with an emphasis on risk	Transcendent and existential Has a strong intuition of what is right and wrong and emphasizes integrity, obedience, and mystery	Relational and communal Emphasis on novelty, sociality, playfulness, and celebration	Nurturing and communal, with an emphasis on healing, wholeness, and community	Intellectual and philosophical, with an emphasis on curiosity, learning, knowledge, and the intellect
Leadership style	Decisive, Design focused, Strategic Will this help increase our capacity for mission?	Demonstrative Motivational Will this help us embody God's concerns?	Persuasive Motivational Will this help us bring people to a point of conversion?	Inclusive Collaborative How will this affect the organization and people in the community?	Prescriptive Analytical How does this line up with theology and scripture?

Metrics for success	Healthy and systematic extension of Christianity within and beyond cultural boundaries Church multiplication	Faithfulness to God's values through visible and tangible actions and consciousness of God's character and presence	Growth through individual and group conversion and in increasing the number of adherents in the movement	People's experience of a sense of belonging, intimacy, and personal transformation	Adequate engagement with, comprehension of, and consistency with truth in all its forms
How it contributes to the health of a movement	Ensuring consistency with core ideas Laying new foundations and designing systems around mobilization and extension	Anchoring the movement in God's values and providing critical feedback for constant realignment	Explicitly valuing the gospel as our core story Adding new people Sharing the message in the local vernacular	Cultivating and integrating people into a socially cohesive community that fosters relational health and discipleship	Systematizing and articulating the multi-dimensional aspects of truth Optimizing operational efficiency
Shortcomings	Driven, demanding, and insensitive to others	Ideological and demanding, short-sighted, simplistic	Anything to "make the deal" Not demanding enough	Obsessive need for harmony and aversion to risk	Demand for ideology conformity and lack of urgency
Slogan	Onward and upward	Repent and believe	Join the party	Love one another	Take time to know God
Likely Myers-Briggs temperament indicator	ENTJ, INTJ, ENTP, INTP	INTP, INFP, ISFP	ENFP, ENFJ	ISFJ, ESFJ	ISTJ, ESTJ
Historical exemplars	Jesus, Paul, Peter, Patrick, John Wesley, Aimee Semple McPherson	Jesus, Jeremiah, James, St. Benedict, Martin Luther, Dietrich Bonhoeffer; Martin Luther King Jr.	Jesus, Phillip, George Whitfield, Billy Graham, Rick Warren	Jesus, St. Francis, Jean Vanier, Mother Teresa, Eugene Peterson	Jesus, Apollos, Augustine, Aquinas, John Calvin, Henri Nouwen

Source: Alan Hirsch and Tim Catchim, *The Permanent Revolution*, 51-53.

APPENDIX B - APEST Summary - Absalom

	APOSTLE	PROPHET	EVANGELIST	SHEPHERD	TEACHER
Brief definition	Brings change & innovation- EXTENDS	Hears and shares the heart of God- DISCERNs	Brings and shares the Good News- RECRUITS	Cares & protects- NURTURES	Grasps & applies truth- EXPLAINS
Further definition	Greek - <i>apostolos</i> - "one who is sent" Visionary and pioneering. Start new churches, businesses or kingdom work Provoke others to seek vision & start new work	Listen to and hear God's heart Speak out revelation from God Understand the times and what people should do. Can stand back from circumstances and see creative solutions	Evangelist = "bearer of Good News" One who brings good news and shares it Evangelists seek out and love spending time with non Christians. They know the gospel, make it relevant to non Christians and provoke others to witness and give them boldness	Care for others and see needs. Easily empathize with others Long to see Christians grow to their full potential. Mature gift will confront as well as encourage	Grasp truth of scripture- are excited by it Speak out truth for others to receive- explain and apply it Provokes others to dig into scripture
Jesus as model	"God sent his Son into the world not to judge the world, but to save the world through him." <i>Jn3:17</i> "Fix your thoughts on Jesus, whom we acknowledge as our <u>apostle</u> and high priest." <i>Heb 3:1</i>	The Ultimate Revelation of God Jesus is prophetic in his pronouncements <i>Mt 24 & 25</i> He prophesies his own future <i>Mt 17:12</i> He fulfils OT prophecy <i>Is 53)</i> Woman at the well <i>Jn 4</i>	Jesus is the Good News	"The Good Shepherd" I am the Good Shepherd. <i>Jn 10:11</i> When Jesus landed and saw the large crowd he had compassion on them because they were like sheep without a shepherd. <i>Mk 6:34</i>	"Teacher" and "Rabbi"
Enjoys	Change! Seeing possibilities Strategizing	Being alone with God Waiting on God Listening to God	Building relationships beyond the church Discussion and sharing	Seeing others grow One-to-one chats Showing hospitality	Bringing clarity, theoretical and practical. Reading and

	Challenging the status quo Dreaming dreams, making them happen	Seeing new possibilities Bringing encouragement Seeing wrongs righted	their point of view Leading people to Christ Encouraging others to witness	Speaking the truth in love Listening (and they're easy to talk to)	studying the Bible Researching, gathering information & insight, helping others understand scripture
Description	Dreaming Initiating Exciting Envisioning Challenging Changing things	Waiting Retreating Seeking God's heart Challenging Confronting Discerning	Enthusiasts People gatherers Networkers Persuasive Proclaimers	Caring Nurturing Loving Supporting Mediating	Trainers Coaches Instructors Inspirers Explainers
Pitfalls	Discerning between good ideas and God's ideas Terrible at completing Not appreciating those who settle and build (<i>shepherd and teacher</i>) Using people as a means to an end	Unaccountable and isolated Harsh and judgmental Not releasing a prophecy once delivered	Lack of accountability Lone ranger Little love for the church One-off decision Milk only diet	Feelings are paramount Think only they care Listen to people more than God Risk adverse Failure to confront as part of loving Poor boundary setting	Legalistic, assume a monopoly on truth Judgmental of others who disagree Too theoretical- miss real life application May miss personal or missional aspects of the church's ministry.
Growth Area	Patience	Accountability	Community	Confrontation	Relevancy
Everyday life	Entrepreneurs Explorers Innovative business people Those who start things People who transform a stuck situation Talent spotters	Visionaries Future focused Campaigners (for justice issues) Speak out their perceptions Often creative e.g. <i>painters, writers</i>	Salesperson Journalists Advertising and PR Politicians (some)	Counselor Social worker Nurse Care-giving professions Community builders Parents	Trainer Coach Demonstrator Researcher Librarian Teachers (especially tertiary or secondary)

Based on notes from Alex Absalom 2014

APPENDIX C - Interview Questions

Below is an excerpt from the liturgy for the ordination of deacons,¹⁸⁰ priests¹⁸¹ and bishops¹⁸² from *A New Zealand Prayer Book*.

After his resurrection and ascension
Christ gave gifts abundantly to the Church.
Some he made apostles, some prophets, some evangelists,
some pastors and teachers; to equip God's people
for their work of ministry and to build up the body of Christ.

1. How do you understand the gifts of apostle, prophet, evangelist, pastor and teacher?
2. To what extent should we expect them to be in operation today?
3. How do you understand the phrase "to equip God's people for their work of ministry"?

The liturgy continues:

We stand within a tradition
in which there are deacons, priests and bishops.
They are called and empowered to fulfill an ordained ministry
and to enable the whole mission of the Church.

4. How do you understand the relationship (if any) between apostles, prophets, evangelists, pastors and teachers and the Anglican tradition of deacons, priests and bishops?
5. What do you understand by "to enable the whole mission of the Church"?
6. To what extent has your training (pre-ordination, post-ordination or other) prepared you to function in each of the five roles?
7. To what extent do you exercise the role of apostle, prophet, evangelist, pastor and teacher in your current ministry?
8. Using Hirsch's Table 2.1¹⁸³ (Appendix A) and the APEST summary sheet¹⁸⁴ (Appendix B) try to identify which of the five descriptions most fit your interests and passion. Note these tables use the term "shepherd" rather than "pastor."

¹⁸⁰ *A New Zealand Prayer Book*, 890.

¹⁸¹ *Ibid.*, 900.

¹⁸² *Ibid.*, 912.

¹⁸³ Hirsch, Alan and Tim Catchim, *The Permanent Revolution*, 51-53.

¹⁸⁴ This is based on notes provided by Alex Absalom.

9. Alan Hirsch offers this insight: “Every significant missional movement has in some way incorporated the five functions into its system. When apostles, prophets, evangelists, shepherds and teachers are working together, a wonderful missional ecology is created.”¹⁸⁵
Can you identify any obstacles to releasing the five APEST gifts in Anglican churches?
10. The Anglican Church has traditionally chosen clergy with teaching and pastoral gifting.
Can you see how a person (ordained or lay) with apostolic, prophetic or evangelistic gifting could be used within the Anglican Church structure?
11. In the Church of England “pioneer” is being used instead of “apostle” to describe someone initiating new projects.
Do you see any advantage or disadvantage to using this terminology in New Zealand?
12. Alan Hirsch’s exegesis of Ephesians 4: 11 proposes that everyone has a calling in at least one of the APEST gifts, not just leaders, but that calling needs to mature to become a ministry. Furthermore he proposes that some people will also have a leadership gift to exercise within that role. For each gift can you identify people, lay or ordained, who seem to fit the profile that Hirsch gives as an indication of the gift of apostle/ prophet/ evangelist/ shepherd or pastor/ teacher?
13. The churches in the Nelson Diocese have been challenged to become missional in focus.
The term “missional” is used in different ways. What is your understanding of the term?
14. What do you see are the obstacles to developing a missional culture in our churches?
15. It has been said that today’s leaders will need new skills especially an ability to relate to a new and changing culture and an ability to work in teams with clergy and lay people. To what extent do you feel you have been trained and to lead and minister in our changing culture and to work in, lead and develop team ministry?
16. What resources or training would you like to see available to assist our church culture to become missional?

¹⁸⁵ Alan Hirsch, Three-Overlooked-Leadership-Roles. fieldusa.org/wp.../Three-Overlooked-Leadership-Roles-Alan-Hirsch2.pdf. Cited online 27/11/2014